

[26th March 1928]

The RAJA OF RAMNAD :—"Sir, I do not know what the suggestion in clause (f) is. Unfortunately, the questioner is not here, and so I am not able to ask him. However, since the hon. the Minister has answered the question, apparently he must have understood this in some light. I wish to know how the hon. Minister has understood that part of the question?"

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Probably the idea of the hon. Member for Madras, Dr. Mallayya, in putting the question is whether officers of the College work on holidays also and whether the gentleman in charge of the College was there on holidays also. The answer is, 'No'."

The RAJA OF RAMNAD :—"The question is whether any officer stays there for more than six hours a day during working days. I understand that the answer in reference to that is that nobody stays there for more than six hours a day?"

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"The answer is that nobody stays for more than six hours a day. The working hours are only four or five hours and they do not stay beyond the working hours."

II

MOTIONS ON THE BUDGET FOR 1928-29.

DEMAND XX—MEDICAL

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"On the recommendation of His Excellency the Governor I move

'that Government be granted a sum not exceeding 77.07 lakhs under Demand XX—Medical.'"

* Mr. R. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, I beg to move

'that the allotment of Rs. 6,05,400 for medical establishments be reduced by Rs. 100.'

"The object of this motion is to draw the attention of the Government to the inconvenience caused to the general public by the frequent transfers of the medical officers in the district headquarters and also in the taluk centres. One has simply to go through the weekly issue of the *Fort St. George Gazette* to satisfy himself about the transfer of a large number of medical officers every week. The number of such officers transferred is appallingly large. Coming to South Arcot, within the last two years, we have had as many as five District Medical and Sanitary Officers, and it is hardly fair to these officers that they should be kicked about like footballs; and if the general health of the public is the object of the Government, they should address themselves to this question and minimise as much as possible the number of transfers, and keep the officers at one place for at least a year, if not more. Now that the hon. the new Minister is in charge of the portfolio, I hope he will bear this in mind and see that this system of making frequent transfers is put an end to."

* Mr. C. RAMASOMAYAJULU :—"Sir, I support the motion. I shall bring to the notice of this House one instance. In spite of repeated requests of the people, in spite of resolutions passed by the municipal council of the place, the Government have chosen to transfer a particular gentleman from our place, although that gentleman has not been there very long—he was there for less

26th March 1928]

[Mr. C. Ramasomayajulu]

than two years. The Government did not pay any heed to the request of the people or the municipal body. Another gentleman came to that place and by the time he made himself popular, he was shifted to some other place. So much so, this frequent transfer of officers is creating so much confusion and inconvenience to the patient public and the hospital resorting public that they find themselves at bay.

"This is with reference to the place to which I belong. May I take this opportunity to bring to the notice of the House the surprise with which the public received the transfer of Colonel Rai because perhaps his presence here was expected to be political inconvenience for interested people? It was generally expected that a certain gentleman was going on leave and that Colonel Rai would take his place. At such a psychological moment that Colonel Rai should be transferred seems to indicate to the public that there is something behind all this—not merely departmental necessity—which the Government are expected to give information to the public about. These frequent transfers of officers ought to be objected to and the Government would do well to take the people into confidence. But they treat the wishes of the people very lightly and they go on transferring officers in their own way. I do not know on what basis these transfers are made. This is a very important matter in which the people would like Government to pay heed to their wishes."

* The RAJA OF RAMNAD :—"I regret, Sir, I must oppose the motion not that I want to strengthen the hands of the Minister with any argument, but from my own experience, I have found that it is a very difficult matter, to avoid these transfers. While one place clamours for the retention of one officer, there is another place which clamours for the transfer of the officer there. How is it possible to reconcile the agitation in various places without frequent transfers of the officers. Further, these officers have got to qualify themselves in some special work. I understand they have to undergo some training in jail medical work. In that case, they have to be sent out to qualify themselves in that work, then there is the agency service. Therefore periodically they are transferred, out of certain necessities. So, I find from my own experience that transfer is more or less inevitable. But what I would urge on the Government is to ask the Surgeon-General to give due consideration to the representations—not mahazars, because they are easily manufactured and can be got both in favour of and against any particular individual—of authorities like the District Board President, the Municipal Chairman, or the Collector of the district. When they make recommendations, the Surgeon-General should give due consideration to them. Apart from this, I do not think it is possible to make a rule that transfers ought not to be frequent or should not take place at all. Therefore, I am obliged to oppose this motion."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Mr. President, I have been carefully listening to the speeches of the previous speakers. I may assure them that the Government are not anxious to transfer the officers unnecessarily from one place to another—firstly on the ground of economy—and unless there is necessity for it, hon. Members may rest assured that such transfers will not be made unnecessarily. But there are circumstances under which these transfers are inevitable. Suppose an officer in charge of a place takes leave or returns from leave or goes on promotion; in such cases, transfer is inevitable. Supposing an officer wishes to study a particular subject, he has to be transferred from one place to another place where there are facilities for

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

studying the subject. I can assure the hon. Members that no transfers will be made unless Government and the Surgeon-General feel that there is absolute necessity.

"As regards the suggestion of the hon. Member for Cocanada that political considerations do weigh with the Government as regards the transfer of officers, the least I can do is to repudiate it on behalf of the Government. I am afraid the hon. Member has done a great deal of injustice to the gentleman himself, Colonel Rai, in suggesting that he was transferred on political considerations. Is it not suggesting that that gentleman has taken part in political agitation? It is suggesting to the Government that the gentleman took part in politics. I wish to assure the hon. Member that the transfer is not made on political considerations (Mr. Harisarvottama Rao: Racial consideration); but on the best information available to Government they thought it necessary, and I repudiate the suggestion that there were any political considerations behind the transfer. I may assure the hon. Member that in the departments under my charge there will be no transfer on any political consideration whatever."

* Mr. K. V. R. SWAMI:—"Sir, the hon. the Minister in the last portion of the speech that he just now made asserted that it was not on political considerations that the transfer was made, but he was not pleased to say on what other considerations the gentleman was transferred. A distinct mention was made by my hon. Friend, Mr. Ramasomayajulu, that the transfer was due to political considerations, not that Colonel Rai was taking any part in politics but that Government expected that Colonel Rai would deal with the students more strictly, because on a particular day when hartal was observed in the city the students of that school stayed away. But Colonel Rai thought that the students should be treated as students in the ordinary way and not on any political considerations, and so he did not take any steps. That was the ground for his transfer and no other ground. If there were any ordinary grounds for his transfer the hon. the Minister ought to have stated them. Two days after the hon. Minister stepped into his office the transfer was made on purely political considerations, and now he asserts in this House that it was not so; and he gives an undertaking that it will not be so in future so long as he remains in office."

11-15
a.m.

"That, I submit, is not correct at all. Otherwise, when the examination of the students was coming up very soon and when everybody was satisfied with the treatment which Colonel Rai had been giving and his special interest in the studies of the students, why should he be transferred all on a sudden? What other considerations can there be for his transfer? Of course, it is true that the hon. Minister is in the know of things. The hon. Minister ought to have stated the considerations on which Colonel Rai was transferred, to disabuse the minds of the people and to show that there was no other ground. With these words, I support the motion."

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA:—"Mr. President, Sir, I for one should also protest against this particular transfer, not on account of political considerations, but on principles of economy. I know the case of Major Barucha in my own place. After a good deal of experience when he was proving useful on various matters, especially municipal questions, and when we wanted his assistance in framing our financial budget with due consideration to the public health of our town, he was transferred to the great prejudice of public interests. Our

26th March 1928]

[Mr. J. A. Saldanha]

wonder is why his transfer which was contemplated long ago was not carried out until my hon. Friend Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar was relieved of his charge. I don't know whether it happened during the time of the present Minister but I am told it was only after a few days of Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar's relinquishing his charge, that he was transferred or ordered to be transferred. I vehemently protest against such transfers on grounds which are not at all justified in public interests."

Mr. R. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" I withdraw the motion, Sir."

The motion was by leave withdrawn.

* Mr. A. B. SHETTY :—" I rise to move

' that the allotment of Rs. 6,05,400 for medical establishments be reduced by Rs. 100 ' to discuss the question of debarring medical officers from private practice.

" I believe, Sir, that no other officers in Government service are allowed the privilege of private practice except the medical officers. This privilege has evidently been given to medical officers on the ground that none of the available facilities for medical relief should be denied to the people. But in practice, this privilege has led to various abuses. The medical officer who is allowed this privilege is naturally more interested in private practice than in his legitimate duties in the hospital. Sometimes his assistant officers, whether assistant surgeons or sub-assistant surgeons, canvass and get patients for him and naturally they get into the good books of the boss, and become his favourites. He becomes to their virtues very kind and to their faults more than a little blind so that the work in the hospital suffers and there is indiscipline also. More than that, people who go and see the medical officer privately and agree to pay him something are often given preference in admission to hospitals. The hospitals, I believe, are more intended for the benefit of the poor people who cannot afford to get the doctor to their houses and it is those people that suffer on account of this privilege given to medical men. Further, the private patients admitted to the hospital are attended to with better care, so that the hospital sometimes becomes a sort of nursing home for these private patients who pay the medical officer. This is not all. I am told that instances are not wanting of medical officers who run their own nursing homes, dispensaries and even chemists' shops, though they may not do it in their own names. It may be said on the other side that abuses of this sort are to a certain extent unavoidable and so long as we have not got a sufficient number of independent medical practitioners to meet the needs of the people, we must allow this privilege to the medical officers in Government service. It is said that in this Presidency including the Madras city we have only 2,500 doctors, whereas, comparing our country with western countries, we must have at least 24,000 medical men. The Government cannot surely afford to employ 24,000 doctors. In western countries we are told that medical relief is almost entirely in the hands of independent medical practitioners and the State maintains hospitals only for the use of the Army, Navy and the Police and for infectious diseases. How can we expect the number of independent medical practitioners here to increase to the proportion we want? What sort of encouragement is given to them? They don't like to settle down in villages because the income they hope to get

[Mr. A. B. Shetty]

[26th March 1928]

there is very little and so they are crowding in the towns. And here in the towns they cannot stand competition, unfair and unequal as it is, with medical officers in Government service. Medical officers in Government service have very many facilities open to them. They use the drugs and appliances of the hospitals, they can get blood and sputum examined in the hospitals and they can get vaccines prepared. Instances are not wanting in which medical officers in charge of district hospitals, when they get a private patient for whom they require vaccine, get the vaccine prepared and send it in the name of some hospital patient without having to pay anything for it. Not only that, private patients consult medical officers during office hours in the hospital, they are treated there and even operated and the money paid to the doctor goes to his own pockets and not to the Government treasury. The result is that independent medical practitioners find it difficult to face this unfair competition and private practice is almost monopolised by medical officers in Government service. I find Major Kureishi, I.M.S., in his inaugural address to the South Indian Medical Association in June 1925 making this statement: He said, that the medical profession in Madras had been reduced to the status of a low-class shopping, and that the practitioner was indistinguishable from the chemist or compounder and that a medical man who merged his advice and prescription into a bottle at so much per ounce was not worthy of being a medical man. He said he did not see more than one or two people in London who had descended to this low position of a doctor-chemist. It is no wonder we find that people do not choose to be independent medical practitioners because they have not got the same privileges as men employed under Government. The number of students going to the medical schools has decreased from 1,336 in 1922-23 to 958 in 1926-27 and I understand the Surgeon-General has been asked to examine the question whether the retention of all the medical schools is necessary. I do not know to what conclusion he has come to. But this thing works in a vicious circle; on the one hand they say that medical men in the service of Government must be allowed private practice so long as we don't have a sufficient number of independent medical practitioners to whom people could go; on the other hand the number of independent medical practitioners will not increase unless they get sufficient encouragement. So then it becomes difficult to get out of this vicious circle. The Government are aware of the conference of independent medical practitioners held in Madras in December last and of the resolutions passed there. In reply to an interpellation of mine asking whether the Government would consider these resolutions, the hon. the Minister in charge stated that if I drew his attention to any particular resolutions, the Government would consider the matter. May I draw his attention, Sir, to three of the resolutions passed at this conference; viz., resolution Nos. 2, 3 and 4? The first asks that more appointments as honorary physicians and surgeons should be made in all State and local board hospitals. As I said already, the hospitals in western countries are all in the hands of independent medical practitioners. The Government here can very well employ independent medical practitioners as honorary assistant officers in Presidency and District hospitals, and after they get sufficient training and experience for a number of years, appoint them as the chief honorary officers and thus gradually displace paid men. Now, half or even more of the medical budget is swallowed up in the pay of the establishment. If this arrangement is made, it will be a great saving to Government and the money that is thus released can be utilised for purposes of promoting public health.

26th March 1928]

[Mr. A. B. Shetty]

“Another resolution says that independent medical practitioners should be appointed in all schools and colleges to teach hygiene and physiology which must be made compulsory and that they must be put in charge of medical inspection. This is a matter which I have urged before this House. If we want medical inspection of our schools to be thorough and efficient, we must employ independent medical practitioners for this work on the staff of the schools. The third resolution asks that medical officers holding pensionable appointments, being full-time men, must be debarred from private practice. The Government say that this cannot be done since there are not sufficient number of independent medical practitioners to attend to the needs of the people. May I draw the attention of the hon. the Minister to a paper read a short time ago by Lieut.-Col. Bradfield to the South Indian branch of the British Medical Association wherein he says ‘that the last 20 years’ overproduction of L.M.P.’s has resulted in a general overcrowding in towns. There are to-day 629 doctors practising in Madras town or roughly one doctor for every 840 people, a higher proportion than in the British Isles where there is one doctor for every 920 people. Other towns Vizagapatam 68, Tanjore 43, also show large numbers of doctors and these figures take no account of the many practitioners of other systems of medicine.’ May I, therefore, suggest, that in the Madras City and some of the larger towns in the mufassal where there are enough number of private practitioners, the Government should put a stop to medical officers having private practice except for consultation and note the results? Specialists whose services are necessary to the people need not be restricted in this way. I hope the hon. Minister will not fail to give his earnest consideration to this question in the best interests of the medical profession.”

11-30
a.m.

* MAHMUD SCHAMNAD SAHIB Bahadur:—“Sir, I am in a position to endorse all that has been said by Mr. Shetty from my own personal experience. Sir, is it not absurd to allow whole-time Government officers to do private work? Then, why not also allow school-masters, engineers, judicial officers, etc., to do private work and take money as these doctors do? Why this anomaly, I cannot understand. If it was considered necessary at a time when there was a scarcity of medical practitioners, I do not think there is any such necessity at all now, to allow this sort of anomaly to continue.

• “Another irregularity which I want to point out is that of allowing the medical officers to charge any amount they like for giving certificates. When there is any riot or assault and wounds or any such thing, people have to go to the medical men for certificates before they file a complaint; and the highest bidder gets the certificate, as both parties approach the medical men. This is indeed putting a premium on dishonesty. I hope this sort of encouragement to dishonesty will not be any longer tolerated. I think the best way of remedying this evil is to fix the maximum fee for these certificates. That is the only way to put an end to these things.”

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA:—“Sir, I beg to intervene in this matter with some misgiving as to the advisability of this motion. In our own experience, we have had very complicated complaints in which we have had to call a District Medical Officer, because there are no other superior doctors to treat such cases. There occur also surgical cases in which we have to get able surgeons and at times it happens that there are not always able surgeons among private practitioners and we have to go to Government medical officers.

[Mr. J. A. Saldanha]

[26th March 1928]

In such an emergency a Government medical officer cannot refuse to give aid. It is a question of life and death, which does not occur in the case of other professions such as engineering and teaching. I do not think that Mr. Schamnad found cases in the engineering or teaching professions where there was such an urgency to get professional aid, such as is indispensable in medical cases, where we cannot but avail ourselves of the services of the Government medical officers."

Mr. A. B. SHETTY :—"Go to the hospital."

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—"If I were to go to the hospital, there is this difficulty: a rule is made that medical dispensaries are only for poor patients."

MAHMUD SCHAMNAD SAHIB Bahadur :—"No, no."

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—"In the Mangalore Government Hospital till recently there was hardly any provision for paying patients. If a patient is rich enough to send for the doctor to his house, can the latter refuse to respond to the call? The present District Medical Officer by husbanding the resources has been able to provide accommodation for a few paying patients, and even then the accommodation is very small. On the other hand, there is a hospital called Fr. Mullers' Medical Institution with ample room for male in-patients, rich and poor. But there is hardly enough room for the treatment of complicated cases of midwifery and other serious women's cases. Until the new Women's Hospital is completed, (it is just now in the stage of foundations), we will not have much accommodation or provision for the treatment of cases of midwifery. Can we not then get the Government medical officers to our houses and can they refuse to come in the absence of more capable medical assistance? These are the difficulties which it would be necessary to provide for. In all these cases the test is the availability of sufficient medical aid, whether we can rely on private practitioners alone and not call in the aid of the Government medical officers. I therefore have some misgiving about the motion before the House."

* The RAJA OF RAMNAD :—"Sir, it will be a great calamity if this resolution is accepted and given effect to. I am not considering the question of the benefits that go to the medical officers and not to the private practitioners. There are ever so many patients in Madras and outside Madras, who come here in large numbers to undergo treatment from experts. I cannot for a moment imagine how any one can tolerate such a state of things as when doctors of such eminence like Dr. Guruswami, Col. Bradfield or Col. Malcomson are rendered unavailable to patients. But there is also one other aspect, that is about the private medical practitioners. We have not heard much of them even in Madras. There are a few able people, of course, like Dr. S. Rangachariar or Dr. Mallayya; but even they have been in Government service. Their number is very small and we cannot, when we get to know the real state of affairs, afford to deprive the public of the services of such eminent and distinguished doctors as I mentioned just now."

"Further, Sir, if these distinguished men in the service are debarred from private practice, the result would be that the few able people now in the mufassal will all rush to Madras and settle down to practise in Madras and you will be depriving the mufassal of the advantage of having them there. There is also this possibility. In the mufassal I know there are people who require the services of the Government medical officers. I am not concerned

26th March 1928]

[The Raja of Ramnad]

so much with the remuneration that is paid to them. By all means if it is found that they charge high fees, let a restriction be placed on them. That will be a move in the right direction. But to go and deprive them once for all of private practice will result in doing a thing which will make the whole of the Presidency suffer. By doing this, my hon. Friend from South Kanara will be doing a disservice to the people of the whole Presidency, in spite of trying to benefit private practitioners by this indirect method."

* Mr. V. I. MUNISWAMI PILLAI :—"Mr. President, Sir, if this motion were to be accepted by this House and the Government medical officers were to be debarred from doing private work, I am afraid the general public who require expert advice would not get it. But at the same time, I must admit that there is a certain amount of evil in allowing medical officers to do private work. Sir, I know one instance where a junior medical officer had to undertake private practice and use the operation table and other necessities from a hospital and he never reported the matter to the senior officer. Later on, anonymous letters went in to the senior officer, who investigated into the matter and found that the junior medical officer had such private practice and accordingly he was brought to book. In that case, a depressed class member, who happened to be a peon in that hospital, had to bring home the truth to the senior medical officer, and consequently what happened was that the poor peon was de-promoted and sent away from the hospital. So, what I would request of the Government is that strict rules must be made as regards the medical officers undertaking private practice, and to see that on no account they use the materials from the hospital. The Government must also see that proper fees are fixed and that these medical officers are not allowed to overcharge the poor people."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, the hon. the Raja of Ramnad, Mr. Saldanha and Mr. Muniswami Pillai have really answered the debate raised by the mover of the resolution. One thing which induces the Government not to adopt the resolution *in toto* is that in many places there are not a sufficient number of qualified people to attend to the necessities of the population in those places. My hon. Friend said that in the Tanjore district there are 43 medical practitioners. The population of the district is about 2,000,000 and there is one practitioner now for a population of 50,000. Does my friend think this is adequate—one man for every 50,000 people? I may, with some amount of certainty, say that in the whole of this province private medical aid is not adequate to the demand and so long as this inadequacy continues, it is necessary that the medical needs of the people are attended to by the medical practitioners in Government service. I am afraid Government will not be willing to put any restriction on the private practice of these Government medical officers.

"One other thing from the standpoint of the medical practitioners in Government service may also be stated, and it is this: These gentlemen were entertained in service on the distinct understanding or the implied understanding that they would be allowed to have private practice, and their remuneration was fixed on that basis. If now they are told that they cannot have private practice, we will have to revise the pay of these officers, and what extra expenditure will be involved, hon. Members of this House will have to consider seriously. I think the cost may come to roughly Rs. 20 lakhs or Rs. 30 lakhs, I am not sure of that. There is also another thing,

11-45
a.m.

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

Sir, which I would like to say. That is, whatever may be the case in European and other western countries, in India most of the eminent men in the medical profession have taken to Government service. (Dr. B. S. Mallayya : 'Question.') Whether there will be a day when they will prefer private practice to Government service, that is quite a different matter. But at present—I do not mean any disrespect to the private practitioners—most of them are in Government service, and I don't think it is proper that we should deprive the population of this province of the best aid that they get from these practitioners who are in Government service, and I hope it is a thing which hon. Members of this House will not countenance.

"The hon. Member from South Kanara said that this places a handicap on private practitioners. True, gentlemen who are employed in hospitals have more facilities than the private practitioners have; but I do think that hospitals are maintained for the benefit of the people, and I do not see any reason why a patient who wishes himself to be treated should not get his treatment from a physician in a hospital provided by the Government. I do admit this is to a certain extent a handicap to private practitioners; but viewing the question from a general standpoint, from the point of view of the people for whose benefit these hospitals are intended, why not the people have the use of these materials and the surgical appliances that are available for them in these hospitals? (A voice: 'They cannot be taken.') The rules do provide for these instruments being taken by medical practitioners in Government service for the treatment of private patients, provided they are not taken during office hours, but are taken out of office hours. I think it is a very salutary rule, and if the medical practitioners in the whole of the province are adequately equipped with the latest instruments, then I think it will not be absolutely necessary to take these things from the various hospitals.

"There is of course a good deal to be said in favour of the motion of my hon. Friend; but the only question is whether we should take that step at the present stage. To a certain extent, the Government have already adopted that principle. For instance, in the Medical College, persons who are employed for teaching pupils there are debarred from having private practice. (Dr. B. S. Mallayya : 'Since when?') I am stating what is happening now, and it is immaterial to know 'since when' because when one good thing is done, I do not think it is necessary to know 'since when' it is done. As regards the senior officers in the Medical department, probably it will be better if in some cases they are confined to consultation by medical practitioners. Perhaps that is a direction in which Government will have to take some steps and place restrictions on medical officers. This is the general attitude of the Government at present, and if instances are brought forward where medical practitioners in Government service abuse their position as Government servants to the prejudice of the general public for whose benefit they are intended, then the matter will be considered by the Government. With these observations which show to what extent the Government are prepared to go, I would very much like my hon. Friend not to press the motion."

* Diwan Bahadur P. KESAVA PILLAI :—"Sir, the hon. the Minister has not answered the question whether in case these Government medical officers are to be allowed private practice, their fees ought not to be regulated. Once the fees were regulated in the case of the Sub-Assistant Surgeon, the Assistant

26th March 1928]

[Mr. P. Kesava Pillai]

Surgeon and the District Surgeon; but now they are all demanding as much fees as they like. Some are kind and sympathetic, but many are very hard-hearted and they demand heavy fees for treating patients in their houses. In most of the mufassal towns, we have no qualified private medical officers except the one or two employed in the local dispensary or hospital. Therefore, the people have to resort to the help of these medical officers in delivery and other serious cases, and these officers have the choice to fix their fees at as high rates as they please and the people are obliged to pay them. Since they are all Government servants, I think Government may very well make rules for the regulation of their fees for daily attendance, for treatment and simple and serious operations. I hope the hon. the Minister will consider that aspect of the question. I agree with my hon. Friend that in most of the mufassal towns we have good hospitals wherefrom medical officers in charge have to and can take all the materials required for private treatment, especially in surgical operations. I request the Government to consider the point about the fees they can claim, and re-issue the old orders."

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—"Sir, I have been very carefully listening to the speech of the hon. the Minister for Public Health, and he graphically described the existing conditions in his department by one apt phrase 'Medical practitioners in Government service'. Sir, that exactly describes the true conditions existing now. In olden days these officers were given very low salaries. A Lieutenant started with Rs. 350 or Rs. 400 and the Lieutenant-Colonel retired at Rs. 1,000. He had ample facilities for private practice, and therefore his pay was very low. Now what is the starting pay and what is the retiring pay of these officers? In those days there were not sufficient private practitioners available for the use of the public. To-day, Sir, we have got any amount of them and more. In olden days we had a noble band of medical officers, Mait and Brown, Browning and Giffard. They were all men who were out to maintain the noble traditions of the profession, particularly Col. Giffard. Sir, they have always been looking down on every one of the officers who utilized the hospital as his own nursing home. That great man laid down a dictum that every patient who came inside the hospital gate should be treated in the same manner. There should be absolutely no difference between the prince and the peasant. He treated all with the same kindness, diligence and skill; whether the patient was a rich man or an inmate of the Friend-in-Need Society, he made absolutely no distinction. The same diet, the same cloth, the same medicine and the same care were given to all alike.

"But, Sir, what is the state of affairs to-day? A pernicious system known as the chit system has crept into the hospital nowadays. A well-to-do or middle class patient wants to command convenience and wants to be given better treatment than the other inmates of the hospital and he consults the medical officers. I do not want to reveal the whole thing to the Members of this House, but he gets a chit and the patient with that chit gets reserved accommodation and preferential treatment in the hospital. He has special consideration and even the ward-boy has some special consideration for him. No medicine is prescribed to that patient without the knowledge of the medical officer from whom he has secured a chit. Every treatment, even giving a sleeping dose, has to be done with the consent of the medical officer who is in charge of the patient. Sir, last year, about the 23rd of November or so, a poor coolie of the Adi-Dravida caste—I want my friends there to listen to

[Dr. B. S. Mallayya]

[26th March 1928]

me carefully—had a fall of about 25 feet from a pandal near the Mint Street. He was brought to the General Hospital. The medical officer on duty at once attends on him, paints some tincture iodine on the external wound and the man is sent home, because there is no vacant bed in the hospital to accommodate him. The man is taken home and collapses, and when he is in a serious condition he is again taken to the Royapuram Hospital where he dies. The post-mortem examination is held and it is discovered that four or five ribs on the right side and a few bones of his skull are broken. And there is no bed available in the General Hospital for this poor coolie because he has no chit! Another patient—he was referred to in this House once before—was a Law College student who was suffering from acute dysentery. He came in a collapsing condition to the General Hospital and could not be admitted because there was no bed available. He was then taken to the other hospital, but before he arrived there he died. Sir, there is another case of a Muhammadan syce who was admitted in the General Hospital. He was given a sleeping dose to make him sleep and it was not known to anybody there, and neither the officer there who was dispensing the medicine nor anybody knew anything about it; but the man is no more. I ask you, Sir, if this patient had been on the chit system, whether that medicine would have been administered to him without the medical officer consenting to it. It was made possible only because the man was not on the chit system. There was a medical officer on the spot . . . ”

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—“ The last case the hon. Member referred to is under trial, I think, in the criminal court. Am I correct ? ”

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—“ I do not want to go into the merits of the case, Sir, but I wanted to mention the circumstances under which the accident became possible. I am not going to refer to it. I bow to your ruling, Sir.

“ Now I go on to the next case. In the Maternity Hospital, on the 13th December this occurred. A woman with a contracted pelvis was operated on twice before in that hospital. She goes there for the third time on the 13th December on a Sunday morning. She goes there at 8-30 a.m. with labour pains. A chit is sent across to the Superintendent of the hospital who was in his quarters to come over and attend to the case. He sends back that chit saying that he is busy and directs a third officer in the hospital to attend to her. The news is telephoned to him that this officer is not in the hospital and he phones back saying that a man may be sent to his house to bring him for attendance on the poor woman. The officer turns up and the woman is operated on at 12-30 p.m. and she dies. She was not on the chit system. If she was, the Superintendent would have come himself and operated on her. Her people even to-day are crying that the Superintendent was busy, busy with private practice, on a Sunday morning. He was in his quarters; but the Assistant Superintendent, one of the most sympathetic and best men we have now in service and who is trying to maintain the glorious traditions of that hospital from the days of Col. Giffard—he was away in Calcutta—I mean Dr. Lakshmanaswami Mudaliyar was not there. The woman was operated by a third officer and she died. What is the use of having a Superintendent with such a high salary, provided with quarters in the hospital itself and who is expected to attend to all serious cases at a moment's notice? What is the good of his saying ‘ I am busy, I cannot attend ’ and sending for a third officer for operation on the woman in a grave crisis. The life is lost.

26th March 1928]

[Dr. B. S. Mallayya]

"Are the Government going to countenance this? Sir, this officer is paid a high salary. Is he expected to be there for attending on the poor people or for private practice? And what is the record of this officer? He is not only a Superintendent of the Maternity Hospital, but he is also the Principal of the Giffard School of Midwifery; and he is also the Principal of the Medical College. Till last year he never used to attend the college every day; and it is said he was attending only once a week and even then he remained in the college only for an hour or two. There was recently a big fire in the college and articles worth about Rs. 5,000 were lost in the fire besides considerable damage to the building. It is the duty of the Principal to go round the building every day. All the predecessors of the present Principal used to go round the college at least once a day. Sir, before this officer returned from the War, out of the eight clinical appointments only two were held by the European officers; and what was the result then? The number of passes did not dwindle at all but always kept the high-water mark. It is only after this officer returned from the War that all this state of things came into existence. And now this officer says that no one is fit for a medical officer's post except one who is English-born, English-trained and . . ."

12
noon.

The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR:—"I rise to a point of order. Is there any connexion between the present motion and the qualifications of the medical officers?"

*The hon. the PRESIDENT:—"I am waiting to see if there is any connexion."

*Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA:—"I am pointing out, Sir, how these European officers devote themselves to private practice entirely, earn more money and then blame the poor Indian officers for their inefficiency. Mind you, Sir, these Indian officers are men trained by these Indian Medical Service officers, and if the latter are not able to turn out better kind of officers what are they for? They may want private practice. I submit medical officers holding responsible posts have some better work to do."

"What is the fun of the Government allowing the Radiologist to have private practice? For, the present policy of the Government in running their X-ray department seems to be to provide ample facilities to the Radiologist to amass a fortune as in the days of John Company. In addition to his exorbitant salary of Rs. 1,500 he was given last year a risk allowance of Rs. 200 a month. He is not a qualified medical man and yet he is allowed to have private practice. The Raja of Ramnad had the misfortune to submit to his treatment and had to pay him Rs. 1,000 and if I remember rightly he told me plainly that his treatment did him no good at all. A few weeks back the President of our Corporation was complaining to me about the blisters produced on his back by the treatment of this gentleman. With these blisters he seems to have gone to Colo. Bradfield who seems to have found fault with poor Gopathi for having submitted himself to X-ray treatment without previously consulting an able doctor. This Radiologist is a full-time officer and he works only for four hours a day. During these hours a large number of photographs are taken daily in the hospital with the Government apparatus and Government materials and about 80 per cent of the charges realized from paying patients is pocketed by him. From the figures supplied to me by the Government on the 1st of March, I find that out of a sum of Rs. 47,337 collected from paying patients nearly Rs. 36,000 has gone to his share. A full-time officer who is paid a Lieutenant-Colonel's salary working only four hours

[Dr. B. S. Mallayya]

[26th March 1928]

a day and during those hours doing private work taking 80 per cent of the collection with Government materials and Government apparatus is a scandal, not tolerated in any civilized country. May I ask the hon. Minister for Public Health whether he has heard of such a thing in England or whether such a thing will be tolerated in any public institution? 'Graft' is too mild a term for this system. Where is the necessity for having this man at such an exorbitant pay? Last year when he was on leave in England that department was run by Dr. Pillai drawing only a third of his salary and turning out nearly double the amount of work without a single complaint from any quarter. In the interests of economy and efficiency, it is high time this post is abolished altogether. If the department is to be maintained there are qualified men, there is Dr. Graham who has X-ray qualification, who has served abroad for fifteen years but when he came over here he was given another job.

"Sir, in olden days when I was an assistant—I think the hon. the Home Member was a student of the Medical College in 1903—the Principalship of the Medical College and the Superintendship of the hospital were held by one officer and he was debarred from carrying on private practice. That appointment was a stepping stone to the Surgeon-Generalship. Now, Sir, if the purity of the services is to be maintained, the administrative medical officers should not be allowed to carry on private practice; and above all the Surgeon-General and the Principal, Medical College, and the Superintendents of big hospitals to whom their office is a recommendation, should not be allowed this concession. For, with private practice, do you think they will be able to carry out their work satisfactorily?"

"I am afraid the whole system will have to be changed. There are poor patients going to them every day and they are asked to go to the officers before they come to the hospital. Under such a state of things do the hon. Ministers realize for a moment that this concession of private practice should be continued? The chit system must be put down at once, and any one who gets a chit should have no preferential treatment over his other poor brothers. I would request the Government, if they are not willing to disallow this concession among subordinate medical officers, to abolish the system at least among those medical officers who are responsible for the efficient administration of the department. Medical officers responsible for gross negligence must be straightaway forced to retire from the service."

* Mr. B. RAMACHANDRA REDDI:—"Mr. President, Sir, I have listened with great care and interest to the several arguments that have been advanced in favour of this motion and I have listened with greater care to the pathetic stories that have been narrated by our hon. Friend, Dr. B. S. Mallayya. But yet, Sir, I am not convinced that this motion should be passed. I am afraid Dr. Mallayya has not seen beyond the headquarter hospitals in this city. I will for a moment take him to the mufassal hospitals (A voice: 'By all means do it') where medical aid is most necessary since the aid there is inadequate and the equipment far from satisfactory. In such places the rich and the middle classes can't go down to adjust themselves to the convenience that is afforded in the hospitals and therefore they have to take advantage of the medical aid from experts available in the mufassal hospitals. I stand here not to defend any medical officers or to uphold their present status but to voice forth the views of the general public, to wit, that the present

26th March 1928] [Mr. B. Ramachandra Reddi]

system should continue until greater facilities in the mufassal are brought into existence. I need not tell you, Sir, that it is the rich and middle classes who pay the greater amount of tax and therefore they must have greater convenience. They should not be put to the necessity of resorting to hospitals where it is not possible to command convenience even at some cost. They should not be put to the inconvenience of going to the hospital; for, as matters stand at present, they can command better convenience at home than in the hospital. Hence we must have the very same practice now obtaining in the mufassal for some years to come. There is a clamour at present that the mufassal hospitals should be increased and that opportunities for medical aid in rural parts should be immensely extended. The doctors should not be debarred from private practice which is a real incentive to them to do better work beyond the hospitals. Hence it will be a calamity if this motion is passed in this House and the Government accepts it. I agree with the hon. the Raja of Ramnad that this motion should not be passed and the old order of things should continue for some time."

* The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR :—“ Mr. President, it would have been no part of mine to take part in this debate, but it is due to the medical profession that some Member of the Government should reply to the speech which has fallen to-day from the lips of a member of that profession, Dr. Mallayya. In the course of his speech he referred to cases which he alleged to have taken place, with the implication that in each case some member of his own profession had fallen from the standards which that profession is supposed to maintain. In one case at least it was perfectly clear which individual member of that profession he was attacking. I have asked my hon. Colleague whether he received from Dr. Mallayya any notice of the fact that he intended to bring these accusations against members of the department under his charge. I am told that he received no notice at all. The result is that all these personal attacks which Dr. Mallayya has advanced cannot be properly defended. He said further that if he were to refer to all the cases of corruption, then the whole department would have to hang their heads in shame. I have no material at my disposal, nor have my hon. Colleagues had an opportunity of having that material at their disposal, to deal with the attack on individual members of the profession. In attacking the whole department he has attacked practically the whole medical profession in Madras, because, as he himself and other members have said, it is the most numerous and the most important section of the medical profession in Madras. Everything he said goes against the whole profession and it seems to me most unfair that a member of that profession should get up in this House and make personal attacks on individual members under circumstances in which he knows there can be no defence. (Dr. Mallayya rose to speak.) I refuse to yield to the hon. Member, Sir. That, I think, is most unfair to those officers who have been attacked, most unfair to this House and to its Members to whom I can only appeal to remember that these attacks have been made under circumstances in which it is not possible for Government on the floor of this House to answer them. It is most unfair to the profession to which Dr. Mallayya belongs. 12-15 P.M.

“ I cannot believe that this was done with the cognizance of the hon. the Leader of the Opposition. I am perfectly certain, knowing the great tradition which he has maintained in this House that he would not have countenanced either the method or the course the hon. Member for Madras has pursued to-day.”

[26th March 1928]

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" I should like to say a few words, Sir."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I do not think I can allow the hon. the Minister to speak now."

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" A personal explanation, Sir. All these facts were before the Government and the hon. Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar who was in charge of the subject. He was perfectly aware who it was I have referred to in person to him."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Was it by means of questions ?"

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" Yes, Sir, my questions were before them and I am still to get the information which I asked for from the Government about the burning incident. Sir, there is nothing personal between us. I have the highest admiration for the officers and I do not want the services to be brought down from the high standard to the low standard."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The latter portion does not constitute a personal explanation."

* Diwan Bahadur R. N. AROGYASWAMI MUDALIYAR :—" Sir, I am sorry my name has been dragged in. As far as I was officially aware, Sir, none of these facts were brought to my notice."

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" He was aware in his personal capacity."

Mr. SAMI VENKATACHALAM CHETTI :—" Mr. President, Sir, of late we have got accustomed to the somewhat excited temper of my hon. Friend the Finance Member . . ."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" Moral lectures."

Mr. SAMI VENKATACHALAM CHETTI :—" When he knows the case he is defending to be hopeless, he assumes a furious temper so as to intimidate us into submission. I must say, Sir, that so far as Dr. Mallayya is concerned, I quite admit that they are very serious charges made against the medical profession and particularly against one or two individuals whose identity was clear though their names were not mentioned. But the answer to that from the Government must be that they would institute an enquiry into those serious charges. Dr. Mallayya is not an irresponsible man; nor does he disown the profession to which he belongs. As a medical man, he makes very serious charges on the floor of this House; and the best way to silence not only the hon. Member for the City of Madras but also others who agree with him in this matter is to institute an enquiry and challenge Dr. Mallayya to substantiate the statements he has made. There is no use of saying that Dr. Mallayya makes charges which cannot be repudiated on the floor of the House by the officers concerned. The hon. Minister may make an enquiry and inform the House of the truth of these charges against these gentlemen."

* Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—" Mr. President, Sir, I am accustomed in another place when cases are argued and any new points are mentioned to hear the question put, 'Does this point occur in paragraph so and so of your affidavit? If not, do not mention that.' It may be the truest of facts, it may be the most relevant of facts; it may have nothing to be said against it; but for the simple reason that it has not been mentioned in the affidavit, you cannot refer to it. I am accustomed to this sort of thing in another place."

26th March 1928]

[Mr. S. Satyamurti]

"Sir, it is the habit of the hon. the Finance Member to deliver lectures to us; but let him remember that all of us are his equals and several of us his superiors in the matter of Parliamentary manners and Parliamentary etiquette. He need not teach us."

MR. ABBAS ALI KHAN :—"To abuse them."

* MR. S. SATYAMURTI :—"My hon. Friend may keep quiet. For he need not be sure that he would not get back things from me."

"I wish, Sir, that the traditions of the House of which he talks so much received as much respect and consideration from the Treasury Bench as from the Opposition who are working under great obstacles. It is easy in this House, Mr. President, to sit behind the Treasury Bench and say 'Aye' to whatever the Treasury Bench says and always get up with them. That brings honours; that brings reward; that brings office. But we sit here from day to day, month to month, and year to year, doing the sisyphæan task of proving to the Government that they are wrong. I ask my hon. Friend to try for a day; I am sure he will give it up in despair. We have no reward except the approbation of our own conscience and our own constituencies. As a reward for it, my hon. Friend, the Finance Member, jumps up, in connexion with a department with which he has no concern whatever. Is he the monitor of the House to tell us how to conduct ourselves? (The hon. Mr. Moir rose to interrupt.) I refuse to yield, Mr. President."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"Is it a point of order?"

The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR :—"Sir, if my intervention in this debate had been out of order, I think the Chair would have called me to order. I refuse to be instructed in this matter by Mr. Satyamurti."

* MR. S. SATYAMURTI :—"This is not a point of order. Let the hon. the Finance Member learn what a point of order is before he begins to teach us. This is unseemly talk which ought not to have come from one who talks big of Parliamentary traditions; he knows nothing about them. It was merely to make me sit down in order to score a point. It is not fair; it is not right. Sir, my point is this. Was it right, Mr. President, that a Member of the Opposition, my hon. Friend, the Member for the City of Madras, should be attacked in this vein? What is this new code of Parliamentary etiquette that he must write in advance to the hon. Minister, send a copy to the hon. Finance Member and say I propose to make an allegation; I propose to say the following things; please therefore be ready with the answers for these things? What are the Minister's Secretaries paid for? The motion is to deprive the Government servants of private practice. They must be ready with all the papers. What is this new Parliamentary etiquette that before I make any reference to anybody here, I must give 24 hours' notice or 72 hours' notice in advance so that they may be ready with the answers? It seems to me, Sir, we really cannot do our duties in this House if the Members of the Treasury Bench begin to lay down such rules. I know the hon. the Finance Member speaks for himself, for I have not heard such things from any other occupant of the Treasury Bench. I hope the new Minister will not follow his footsteps; if he does so, I wish him joy of it. I have not heard anybody saying that I must give early notice of what I propose to say. Do they give us notice of what they propose to say as a possible defence on

[Mr. S. Satyamurti]

[26th March 1928]

any matter, so that we may go on exchanging documents for two weeks or two months on what we are going to say after two months? That is not Parliamentary business; that is not Parliamentary tradition.

"On the merits of the case, Mr. President, I think I am betraying no secret at all when I say that I am in a position to state that the present Surgeon-General himself is not satisfied with the system under which Government servants are allowed to have private practice. It has got to be looked into very carefully. It is liable to be abused easily. It would do no good either to the Government or to the patients or to the practitioners themselves. Therefore merely saying with a lofty mien, 'You have made an accusation which you ought not to have made,' may deceive the unwary amongst us and frighten some who are probably timid. But none on this side of the House is unwary or timid. We refuse to be put down by these statements. Unless the hon. Minister is going to examine the statements of my hon. Friend, the City Member, we are going to believe that the Government merely wanted to bully and frighten us and would not face facts squarely.

"My hon. Friend, the floor Leader of the new Independent Nationalist Party, said that he was not officially aware of these facts. He is no longer an official and he owes it to this House to say whether he is aware of this instance or not. I am told and I believe that at least in one instance in which Colonel Hingston was in charge and the woman died, he was informed of it and he asked Colonel Hingston for an explanation and he got nothing satisfactory. That, Sir, is a different matter. The point is that the hon. Member for the City of Madras made certain allegations and they had to be answered by the hon. Minister. But to suggest that all these various officers whose reputation is attacked should be present here to answer those charges is a new Parliamentary code. That the permanent servants of the Government should be present here to answer the charges against them is a position with which I am not familiar in any Parliament . . ."

The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR:—"May I ask the hon. Member whether it was suggested by me that the permanent servants should be present here to answer these charges?"

Both the hon. the Finance Member and Mr. Satyamurti were standing; Mr. Satyamurti declined to yield.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT:—"Both the hon. Members are requested to resume their seats. Is it a point of order that the hon. the Finance Member wants to raise?"

The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR:—"I wish to ask the hon. Member whether it was suggested by me . . ."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT:—"The hon. Member will have to wait for that."

* Mr. S. SATYAMURTI:—"I do think that the suggestion that the permanent servants should be present here in order to repel the attacks against them is a primitive conception of Parliamentary responsibility I am not familiar with. The responsible Ministers are there to answer these charges. All of us are convinced that this system of Government employees being allowed private practice is a system which is capable of being abused and must be completely prohibited; whether immediately or not is a question deserving examination. The object of this motion is to impress upon the Government

26th March 1928]

[Mr. S. Satyamurti]

the scope for abuse in this system, so that they may examine all the charges made and make up their minds to put an end to this system as early as possible and to minimise the chances of abuse in any direction, until the system is put an end to."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Does the hon. the Finance Member wish to say anything as a personal explanation ? "

* The hon. Mr. T. E. MOIR :—" I wish to say that it was not I who made any suggestion that when attacks were made against officers of Government they should be present on the floor of this House to defend themselves personally. What I said was that when attacks of that kind were going to be made on officers of Government, then it was only fair to give intimation of the fact to the Member in charge of the department so that he might be able to elicit the facts and, if necessary, defend them on the floor of the House when the attacks are made."

* Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" Sir, I did not want to give an instance which I personally knew. The last word of the hon. the Finance Member tempts me to give that instance. I am only asking you and the hon. the Finance Member if I should have anticipated this many hours back and given intimation to the hon. Member. I am one of those who think that medical officers should be allowed private practice in certain circumstances, especially in the mufassal. But Resident Medical Officers should not be allowed private practice. I know the case of a young man who had an accident near the Royapetta Hospital. He was taken to the hospital. He was unconscious. The officer in charge was not there. The patient was kept unconscious in the verandah pending the arrival of the officer. The young man belongs to a respectable family having some family doctors. When he became conscious, he said who he was and his relatives were phoned for. They took him home and a family doctor performed an operation. If this young man did not recover consciousness in time, he would probably have died in the verandah. Therefore I think it is quite necessary that at least so far as the Resident Medical Officers are concerned whose duty it is to reside in the hospital to attend to emergency cases, they should not be allowed private practice. I gave this instance in order that Government may see that resident officers in hospitals are prevented from having private practice."

12-30
p.m.

* Mr. M. V. GANGADHARA SIVA :—" Sir, I quite appreciate the facts mentioned by Dr. Mallayya. Patients go to doctors in whom they have confidence and from whom they can get facilities. So, neither this House nor the Government can have anything to do with the choice of the patients. So, Government medical men should not be prevented from having private practice. I support what the hon. Member, Mr. Venkataramana Ayyangar, said that Resident Medical Officers should not have private practice."

Mr. A. B. SHETTY :—" Sir, I beg to withdraw the motion."

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Does the hon. Member (Mr. Abdul Hamid Khan) propose to speak on the three motions he has given notice of, because all of them relate to the same subject ? "

[26th March 1928]

- * **MR. ABDUL HAMID KHAN** :—“ Mr. President, Sir, I rise to move
‘ to reduce the allotment of Rs. 6,05,400 for medical establishments by Rs. 100 ’

to draw the attention of the Government firstly to the utterly inadequate representation of Muslims in Higher Medical Service as Surgeons, Civil Assistant Surgeons, secondly, to the unjustifiable manner in which appointments were made as Assistant Surgeons previous to the appointment of the Selection Board, and thirdly, to the refusal of the Government to entertain Muslims as Assistant Surgeons when it is not difficult to secure Muslim applicants for such posts. In dealing with this question I shall point out to the Government that so far as the Medical Department is concerned, very little has been done to encourage the members of my community. I might give the Government information that there is only one Muslim acting as Surgeon in the department and that there are only seven Muslims as Assistant Surgeons in the whole Presidency. Even though there are such a few number of Muslims in this department occupying such posts, the Government have not given employment to Muslims applying to these posts. Last year before the Selection Board was appointed some of them applied but they were told that they would have to wait until the Selection Board was appointed which would make selections. Before the Selection Board sat actually to make the selections I know of cases of persons belonging to other communities whose representation in this department is adequate, who were appointed because of the fact that they satisfied certain members in the Medical department, who had to give the posts they applied for, I think, it is not the Surgeon-General who is responsible for these appointments but the gentleman who is practically in charge of the department. If the applicants who were appointed before the Selection Board met were to appear before the Board I am sure and certain that those applicants would not have been selected by the Board. There was only one Muslim who applied for an Assistant Surgeon's post and appeared before the Selection Board. He did not pass from this University. He came from the Bombay Presidency. He was the only Muslim who was selected last year. Yet he has not been appointed because he has been given the last place in the list. Then another Muslim came forward who had passed out of the Madras Medical College. When he applied for a post he was told that he should wait till the Selection Board met three or four months after. In view of the fact that there is very inadequate representation of Muslims in the higher posts in this department cannot the Government take into consideration this fact and give chances to one or two applicants who come once in two or three years and thus encourage members of communities who do not have sufficient representation in the department? It is to impress these facts on the Government I tabled these cuts and I hope that this matter will receive due consideration.”

* **MR. M. V. GANGADHARA SIVA** :—“ Mr. President, Sir, it is the depressed classes who embraced the Medical Department first. When the Western Allopathic system was introduced no community other than ours was bold enough to enter this department on account of religious scruples and lack of boldness. My community which was bold and hard-serving at all times of epidemics entered this department first and popularized the Allopathic system. The Government should therefore see that such a community is given preference.”

26th March 1928]

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I think the hon. Member will have to wait for another opportunity to put forth the claims of his community. These motions are tabled to put forth the claims of the Muhammadan community."

The hon. Mr. J. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, the hon. Muhammadan Member for Madras told us that there was not sufficient representation of Musssalmans in the service. That is a matter which requires the sympathetic consideration of the Government. The hon. Member said that there was not even half a per cent or one per cent of representation. I give for the information of the hon. Member that out of 220 Surgeons and Assistant Surgeons there are six Muslims already in service and it works out to 3 per cent. The hon. Member referred to a case of a Muhammadan candidate who was selected but was not appointed as Assistant Surgeon. The facts are this man was selected and he has to undergo certain course before he could be appointed. As soon as the course is completed he will certainly be entertained in the Government service and the hon. Member need have no misapprehensions whatever in that matter."

Mr. ABDUL HAMID KHAN :—" The hon. Minister has not given me . . ."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The hon. Member has, I am afraid, no chance of saying anything now."

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" Sir, I quite appreciate the answer given by the hon. Minister for Public Health. But I should like to know whether there are any principles on which officers are admitted in Government Medical service. In olden days there was competitive examination and persons who topped the list were taken in service. Repeated questions were asked on the floor of this House whether the Government followed any principle. We find now, Sir, that men are taken according to the influence they have on the officers in the Surgeon-General's office. Sir, it is neither caste nor ability that is taken into consideration but influence with high personages in the Surgeon-General's office. I should like to know whether the Government are going to have the good old system of competitive examinations when merit and merit alone was the test."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The question is 'to reduce the allotment of Rs. 6,05,400 for medical establishments by Rs. 100.'"

The motion was put to the House and declared lost.

A poll was demanded and the House divided as follows :—

Ayes.

- | | |
|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 1. Mr. Mahmud Schamnad Sahib. | 14. Mr. K. R. Karant. |
| 2. " Sami Venkatachalam Chetti. | 15. " C. Ramasamayajulu. |
| 3. " S. Satyamurti. | 16. " P. Bakthavatsulu Nayudu. |
| 4. " C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar. | 17. " A. Kaleswara Rao. |
| 5. " T. Adinarayana Chettiayar. | 18. " R. Srinivasa Ayyangar. |
| 6. " P. Anjaneyulu. | 19. " L. K. Tulasiram. |
| 7. " J. A. Saldanha. | 20. " B. Ramachandra Reddi. |
| 8. " V. Ramjee Rao. | 21. Rao Bahadar C. S. Ratnasabapati |
| 9. " Tajudin Sahib. | Mudaliyar. |
| 10. " G. Harisarvottama Rao. | 22. Mr. Abdul Razaack Sahib. |
| 11. " Abdul Hamid Khan. | 23. " K. Sarabha Reddi. |
| 12. " K. V. R. Swami. | 24. Kumara Raja of Venkatagiri. |
| 13. Dr. B. S. Mallayya. | |

[26th March 1928]

Noes.

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. The hon. Sir Norman Marjoribanks. | 19. Mr. J. Bheemayya. |
| 2. " Khan Bahadur Muhammad Usman Sahib Bahadur. | 20. " V. Ch. John. |
| 3. " Mr. T. E. Moir. | 21. " Kavalappara Muppil Nayar. |
| 4. " " A. Y. G. Campbell. | 22. Subadar-Major S. A. Nanjappa Bahadur. |
| 5. " " M. R. Seturathnam Ayyar. | 23. Mr. Al. Ar. Narayanan Chettiyar. |
| 6. " " S. Muthiah Mudaliyar. | 24. " T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai. |
| 7. " Dr. P. Subbarayan. | 25. " K. Krishnan. |
| 8. Rao Bahadur C. V. Ananthakrishna Ayyar. | 26. " N. Siva Raj. |
| 9. Mr. F. B. Evans. | 27. " M. V. Gangadhara Siva. |
| 10. " H. A. Watson. | 28. Rao Sahib L. C. Guruswami. |
| 11. " G. T. Boag. | 29. Mr. V. I. Muniswami Pillai. |
| 12. " A. McG. C. Tampoe. | 30. " W. P. A. Soundarapandia Nadar. |
| 13. " S. H. Slater. | 31. " S. Venkayya. |
| 14. " C. B. Cotterell. | 32. " M. A. Manikkavelu Nayakar. |
| 15. " P. J. Gnanavaram Pillai. | 33. " A. T. Luker. |
| 16. " R. Foulkes. | 34. " S. Arpudaswami Udayar. |
| 17. " H. B. Ari Gowder. | 35. " G. R. Premayya. |
| 18. " A. Balakrishna Shetty. | 36. Swami A. S. Sahajanandam. |
| | 37. Rao Sahib R. Srinivasan. |

Neutral.

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. Mr. Abbas Ali Khan. | 6. The Raja of Panagal. |
| 2. Syed Ibrahim Sahib Bahadur. | 7. Diwan Bahadur M. Krishnan Nayar. |
| 3. The Zamindar of Kallikota. | 8. " P. C. Ethirajulu Nayudu. |
| 4. Diwan Bahadur R. N. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar. | 9. Mr. T. K. Chidambaramatha Mudaliyar. |
| 5. The Zamindar of Gollapalli. | 10. Rao Bahadur K. Sitarama Reddi. |

Ayes 24. Noes 37. Neutral 10.

The motion was lost.

12-45
p.m.

* Mr. G. HARISARVOTTAMA RAO :—" Mr. President, Sir, I rise to move
'to reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,96,500 for pay of officers by 100.'

"The object of this motion is to draw particular attention to the neglect of the Ayurvedic, Unani and other indigenous systems as well as to discuss the adequacy of provisions of drugs now made for rural dispensaries. It is a cry almost in the wilderness to-day to speak of Ayurvedic, Unani and other systems. We are always pointed out to the one achievement, the Indian School of Medicine and we are asked to be satisfied with that sweet that has been thrown to us by the powers that be. A great deal of talk there was, Sir, in this House about the inadequacy of medical aid in this country. It was, contended by the apologists of the monopolist I.M.S. that private practice was a necessity for Government officers because there was not sufficient medical aid forthcoming for the people. But what has this Government done for improving medical aid that can be rendered to the people of this nation by national methods? What has this Government done for either Ayurvedic or Unani or other systems of medicine? A number of questions were raised on the floor of this House more especially in regard to the grants that were made to the local bodies to be spent on medical institutions. I was told, Sir, that Government was awaiting the results of examinations in the Indian School of Medicine and that when graduates—no graduates, it is not even a college, it is still a school—when students come out it will be time enough to think whether medical grants may be given to local bodies. This is a queer way of dealing with the medical problem of the country. Local bodies are already employing Ayurvedic men and they have been dispensing Ayurvedic

26th March 1928] [Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

medicines. Because they know that the local bodies will be in a very good position to render national medical aid to the people of this country and extend the same in a rapid manner and because local bodies are active the Government, who have a most delicate feeling for their I.M.S. officers, come forward and say, 'No, not until we have got a class of men who can deal with these things and therefore we do not want to contribute to the funds of the local bodies to render aid to national medical institutions.' That is the plea that has been put forward by the Government. Has the Government taken any steps towards standardizing practice in these Ayurvedic and Unani systems? Has there been any attempt made for registration of the Medical Practitioners under a proper Medical Registration Act in so far as the Ayurvedic, Unani and other systems are concerned? These are ancient systems in the country that claim adherents not in thousands but in lakhs. And, if the Government only chooses, it is quite possible that in the initial stages they can get a fair register made of these people. But here the monopolists—I.M.S. officers—stand in the way. They are the only scientists in the world. Theirs is the only authority in science. The English system is as much empirical as the Indian system except for the fact that it has been encouraged by the States. I do not grudge that in certain directions they have made progress and all facilities must be given for further progress. But in this country no attempt has yet been made to make a list of the practitioners under the Ayurvedic, Unani and Siddha systems and no attempt has been made to put some of them on an equal footing with the registered medical practitioners of the West. What is the reason? The monopolist I.M.S. officer must have perfect control on the financial aspect of medical practice. He and his system must have the fees that accrue out of registration. That is the reason, I believe, that has carried away the Government on this question of registration. Now, Sir, what is it the Government has been doing towards the spread of medical education in Ayurvedic, Unani and other systems except this institution of the School for Indian Medicines in Madras? What are the grants that Government has given to the Ayurvedic medical institutions or to Unani medical institutions of this country? Local boards are allowed to run institutions in their own way. No attempt, no serious attempt has yet been made to work out a system of education in these branches. It has not yet been extended in any large measure. The Principal of the Indian School of Medicine was said to have been deputed to the United Provinces to study the system by which the Government there is bringing up the Ayurvedic system of Indian medicine and other indigenous systems of medicine. That has been in the air for some time and we have known nothing further about it and questions on the floor of this House have not been able to elicit more information than this, that he was deputed and that he went to the United Provinces. With regard to research in the matter of Indian medicine what is it that the Government has undertaken? No doubt there was some attempt made with Dr. Coman as the officer to deal with Indian drugs. But what further? Indian drugs are being exported and the English pharmacopœia is full of instances where Indian drugs are used and manufactured. What is it that is being done here for the manufacture or preparation of Indian medicines? Is there any institution in which these things are being examined and any headway being made to purify the systems if they are contended to be not good and pure enough? Is there any research institute which the Government desires to found or any scheme put forward for such research institutions. Has any advance been made? I say

[Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

[26th March 1928]

none. Next, what about the popularization of these medical systems? Wherever you go, you meet with doctors, lanterns and lantern slides and people are lecturing. During health weeks and at other times lectures are being delivered. What are the lectures about? They are all about western medicine, western food and western advertisements. With regard to the Indian medicine, I know my friend, Dr. Lakshmipathi, has manufactured a number of slides touching the most important aspects of Indian medicines and yet even those slides are not used by the so-called men of the western system and everything Indian is tabooed. Government must find, immediately find, the method by which they can make even the western medical men take to Indian drugs so far as it is possible. I do not see why men should not use ginger when they are prepared to use the very thing prepared out of ginger. I do not see why they should not use cinamon when they are prepared to use things made out of it. I do not see why medical practitioners should not use cardomom when they are prepared to use it in the imported form. There has not been any attempt made—not even the least attempt has been made—by the Government to find out what can be manufactured in this country from indigenous drugs. Now, Sir, if all these could be undertaken by the Government—it would certainly mean a great deal of finance. I know it is a financial question and I know it is a question which will immediately affect the hon. the Finance Member who will forthwith interfere. That is the real difficulty. That is the way the shoe pinches and I wish the hon. Ministers who sit on the Treasury benches in the composure that they are safe, I wish they went into the whole question carefully and considered all aspects of the question. There is a great deal that can be done. Much of the money that has been wasted on the so-called medical institutions of the country can be saved. Most of the funds that are now being utilized to prop up the alien system can be better utilized and we can have a very much larger number of medical practitioners in this country who can immediately attend to the needs of the rural areas. It will be time enough to think further when we have made some headway in registering these men, in giving certain powers and facilities for research work and in giving publicity to the work that is being done on behalf of these systems. If the Government undertakes to do this much of work, I am sure the complaint about want of medical facilities in this country would be no longer there within the course of say five to ten years. I have therefore much pleasure in making this motion."

1 p.m.

* Mr. P. ANJANEYULU :—" Mr. President, I have much pleasure in supporting this motion as one who has given notice of the same. It is hardly necessary at this stage of the debate to dwell elaborately on all the benefits derived by the Ayurvedic and Unani systems of medicine in this country, and I shall confine myself to one or two instances. Two days ago, an instance was quoted by no less a person than the President of the Corporation of Madras that when he was attacked by jaundice he underwent treatment for nearly two months by an I.M.S. officer of the City and he found no escape from it, but in less than three days, he was saying as his personal experience, an Indian doctor following the Ayurvedic system was able to cure him thoroughly. That being the case, and this subject being a Transferred one and the Member in charge thereof being Indian, it is rather a question why they did not—they must have had experience of these systems—encourage these systems. After all, the previous Ministry or the Ministry previous to that, inaugurated the Indian School of Medicine in this City, but it has not done all that is necessary for that school to prosper. One of the great needs of that school seems to be that the

6th March 1928]

[Mr. P. Anjaneyulu]

students attending there (and there are only 300 now) are left entirely to themselves to find out ways and means for lodging and boarding. I hope I may take this opportunity of inviting the attention of the hon. Minister concerned to the urgent necessity there is for improving this school by the provision of a hostel, and putting it in a flourishing condition. We cannot say that attempts have not been made, but the attempt that is now made is only a consolation prize. It is all done in a half-hearted way, and no one seems to encourage it and see that it comes to stay, that it is useful not only to the City but also to the mufassal.

“As for the other proposition, namely, the inadequacy of the provision for rural dispensaries, this is another consolation prize. Sir Patro and the Raja of Panagal thought of establishing rural dispensaries all over the country. But now they are left practically to shift for themselves. Hardly enough provision is made for one month's expenditure, if properly utilized, and it is within my personal knowledge that in some of the rural dispensaries they give only watered down medicines, like the watered down milk obtainable in the City of Madras. Instead of giving these medicines it would be better to leave the patients to themselves, so that they may find their own doctors. Instead of having a number of these starving dispensaries, it would have been really better if they concentrated their attention in certain selected localities and had given a fair trial to this system. With these observations I recommend this cut to the acceptance of the House.”

* Mr. A. KALESWARA RAO :—“Mr. President, Sir, I wish to show what scant attention is paid to the Indian medicine by the Government. This year the budget for medicine comes to 90 lakhs, and we see only one lakh provided for the Indian School of Medicine as well as the dispensary attached to it. Except that a medical school and a dispensary are established in Madras, nothing is being done in the shape of encouraging the Indian system of medicine. Sir, as early as 1923, a committee to investigate into the question of encouraging Indian medicine with regard to its efficiency, suitability and importance was appointed under the distinguished presidency of the hon. Dr. Usman, and the Committee made excellent proposals. Of course, they were not extremists and they did not want that the Allopathic system should go out altogether or be replaced by Indian system of medicine. It went on on the most moderate lines, and their recommendations have not been paid any heed to by the Government all these five years, except that one School of Indian Medicine has been established and there the progress has been going on at a snail's pace. While the expenditure on the Allopathic system is large, the expenditure on Indian system is very small. It is too late to contend now that Indian system of medicine is not a science or that it is not efficient. All those arguments advanced by the anti-Indian medicinists were refuted by the Government Committee itself. With regard to efficiency, what the Committee has stated is this: ‘A number of such institutions exist even in our own Presidency town, and, though hampered for lack of sufficient funds, they are nevertheless holding their own against comparatively well-advanced dispensaries in the neighbourhood maintained by the Corporation, and are popular amongst all sections.’

“They have also quoted with approval the opinions of various medical men that the indigenous system is by far cheaper as the drugs are available in all parts of India and used in fresh form as juices, decoctions, etc., which

[Mr. A. Kaleswara Rao]

[26th March 1928]

is not the case with the Allopathic system which includes spirits, etc. How the drugs can be found very cheaply and also how they can be used fresh, they themselves have testified to. They also say that there are hundreds of drugs, vegetables, animals and minerals used widely by the Ayurvedic system which no western-trained medical men have heard of. This country is full of forests and the drugs are available easily and the people have been using them from time immemorial without resorting to the self-sufficient Allopathic doctors. The Committee also states that 'we have received overwhelming evidence in support of this claim and we have numerous testimonials from men of light and leading testifying to the great benefits derived from the Indian system of medicine; and many cases after being given up by Allopathic doctors have been cured under this system.' We need no more testimony than the recommendations of the Committee itself. The Committee have made certain valuable recommendations. They say that in the very first year the Ayurvedic system of medicine should begin with a budget of 5 lakhs, and that there should be a department altogether separate from the Surgeon-General's department. The Surgeon-General was said to have expressed the opinion that recognition of the Ayurvedic system means putting back the clock of civilization by 150 years. That was the opinion of the Leader of the Allopathic system. But contrary to this opinion the Committee has written its report and the Government has established a School of Indian Medicine. Therefore, the first and most important thing is to establish a separate branch of Indian medicine. They have suggested that a Commissioner of Indian Medicine should be appointed to be in charge of this department, and also a new Committee of Indian Medicine, with the Minister as its President, and consisting of well known Indian medical scholars as members. These two things if immediately established would facilitate unhampered the growth of this system under the Government. They have also stated that one lakh should be given as grant to local boards and private agencies in order to encourage the Indian system of medicine. But nothing has been done in that direction. They wanted to establish a big college at Madras, but we have only a School of Indian Medicine. We want more schools of Indian Medicine in the Telugu country and the Tamil country. The expenditure on the staff, on clothing, etc., does not come to a fraction of the amount that they have suggested. I therefore draw the attention of the hon. the Minister that he should at once take up this important and also popular business and spend much more money on the improvement of Indian medicine, at least on the lines suggested by the Government Committee itself. Therefore I have great pleasure in supporting this motion."

* The RAJA OF KALLIKOTA :—" Mr. President, Sir, I rise to support this motion. The scheme of bringing medical aid within the easy reach of the rural population was introduced by my hon. Friend the Raja of Panagal when he was the Chief Minister in the year 1924, and it was stated then that the starting of a large number of Ayurvedic and Unani dispensaries would serve a very useful purpose. There were however some difficulties four years ago for the starting of Ayurvedic dispensaries owing to the lack of qualified hands. Four long years have now passed, Sir, and the Government School of Indian Medicine is turning out a certain number of qualified doctors. Some local boards are also sending men with scholarships to this school with the idea of utilizing their services in the rural parts. May I ask what is the attitude

26th March 1928]

[The Raja of Kallikota]

of the Government towards these Ayurvedic dispensaries now? Will they support local boards with adequate grants if they start rural Ayurvedic dispensaries?

"The second suggestion made was that there should be a large number of itinerating or travelling dispensaries, but it was recognized by the Government that these travelling dispensaries would not serve a useful purpose and therefore this was dropped.

"The third suggestion was that private Allopathic practitioners should be given encouragement to settle down in villages for practice by the grant of money subsidies. This scheme is now in force and the local boards have been asked to work it, unfortunately, without the funds to make it a success or a boon to the public. The rural dispensaries under these local boards are absolutely starved. Government do not pay any subsidy to these rural dispensaries towards the purchase of medicines and drugs. It is hardly to be expected that the local boards, with their meagre resources, should equip their rural dispensaries with a free and full supply of medicines. I have known of several cases, Sir, where the taluk board makes a certain allotment for the year for the purchase of medicine and long before the year comes to a close this supply is exhausted and the doctor for the remaining portion of the year has to either beg for the medicines or to supply them from his own pocket, as the taluk boards cannot afford to give him a further supply. This is a very unsatisfactory state of things. I have therefore to impress upon the hon. the Minister the great necessity of subsidising rural dispensaries with a fixed grant for the purchase of medicine and I suggest that a lump sum subsidy of at least Rs. 500 per annum should be given for each rural dispensary. With these few words I close my remarks."

* MR. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—"Mr. President, Sir, the motion that is raised is on two definite points. One is to protest against the neglect of Ayurvedic, Unani and other indigenous systems, and the other to discuss the adequacy of provisions of drugs now made for rural dispensaries. I wish to point out in my turn, Mr. President, that the interest shown by this Government in the direction of encouraging indigenous systems of medicine is hardly worth commendable. They have started a school no doubt of Indian Medicine in the City of Madras, but the way in which they are conducting that school is most unsatisfactory. They are giving out very niggardly funds and the number of beds in the in-patient hospital are very few, whereas the number of patients that are resorting to this school and hospital is too large. From the returns of the report of the School of Indian Medicine, I think a fair idea would be had as to the large number of patients that are coming, as to the cheapness of administering Indian medicine to those patients and also the way in which the Government is moving. They are proceeding in such a slow and snail-speed manner and that it hardly gives us any hope that the system will at any time succeed at all in this country with such a lack of interest from the Government. The School of Indian Medicine, especially the Unani section, of which I can speak with some knowledge, is not properly staffed. Except the one teacher who holds any diploma from a recognized school of Unani medicine, the other assistants are hardly competent to do any good work. I should say without disparity to their merit, they are not the proper men for the job that they are entrusted with; especially the choice of the recent one of them was a matter of favouritism of the so-called Advisory

1-15
p.m.

[Mr. Basheer Ahmad Sayeed]

[26th March 1928]

Committee of that school; and no proper test was held with regard to the selection of the assistants to the present Lecturer in the Unani section of that school. There is also a Unani Board appointed for the school, of which so far as I am aware the members are hardly any of them doctors with the exception of one. They are not practising doctors in Unani medicine or any other medicine for the matter of that. That is a board constituted of laymen to advise on medical matters.

"The other point, Mr. President, is the school is not developed as it ought to be. The Herbarium which should have been within these two or three years an accomplished fact is still in the making and from the budget estimates I find a special pay allotted for the Superintendent of the Herbarium. I do not know whether the Herbarium that exists now requires a Superintendent to look after. I visited the school not long ago and saw the Herbarium with some plants. It is hardly encouraging to have such a thing like that and to pay a superintendent Rs. 100 or Rs. 200 as a special officer for that Herbarium is a question which requires scrutiny.

"In the rural districts Indian medicine is not encouraged at all. The municipalities are not goaded by the Government to start their own dispensaries, in Unani and Ayurvedic medicine."

*The hon. the PRESIDENT:—"I hope the hon. Member will give at least ten minutes' time for the hon. Minister to reply."

*MR. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED:—"I will wind up, Sir. In spite of the fact that Unani medicine, Ayurvedic medicine and other indigenous systems of medicine are cheaper, yet the Government have not taken any steps to encourage the municipalities and local boards to open dispensaries in local areas. The existing dispensaries of an Allopathic nature in the districts of South Arcot and Salem are hardly accessible to the large number of patients who suffer in the rural areas. The dispensaries are situated in far off places at a distance of 10, 20 or 30 miles and are hardly accessible to the patients. I therefore urge upon the Government that they should devote more attention—not in the manner in which they are now devoting—but I say, their attention must be devoted more towards the development of the indigenous systems of medicine than towards the Allopathic system."

The hon. MR. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR:—"Mr. President, Sir, while I entirely sympathise with the feelings expressed by the hon. Members of this House that it ought to be the aim of Government to encourage Unani and Ayurvedic systems of medicine, I feel I must repudiate the statement that the Government are not taking steps to encourage these systems of medicine. This question has been engaging the attention of this Government for about seven or eight years and the Government did recognize these two systems of medicine and they started this School of Indian Medicine. In the School of Indian Medicine there are about 400 students receiving instruction and I am perfectly sure that when the first batch of students are turned out in the course of another three or four months and after these students have taken their degree in that course, the question of their employment will receive due consideration. At present that question has not risen for consideration. Surely, hereafter when these pupils pass their final examination and go out of the school, the question of their employment will

26th March 1928] [Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

arise and I may say it will be favourably considered by Government, because the Government have established a school and have trained a number of young men in these systems of medicine. The Government consider the systems to be efficacious—I am not comparing these systems with the other systems—the Government would not raise objection.

“The hon. Member said that no research in Indian medicine is being made. I may say that so far as I am able to gather, research in Indian medicine is made not in this province but in Calcutta. I believe this Government also will have the benefit of the researches made by Calcutta both by private practitioners and also, of Government; and two men have been sent by this Government for instruction in the Calcutta Research Institute to do research work and when they come from there, this Government will have the benefit of the knowledge acquired by these two gentlemen. It is not always possible to start a research institute in each province. We have to benefit by the results of the experiments carried on not only in other parts of India but in other parts of the world also and if Calcutta gives the benefits of its research I don't see why we should not take advantage of it. What I say is that we have just started a School of Indian Medicine and if the young men that are turned out prove their capacity for research work, as I am sure they will in course of a few years, the question of research will be considered. (Dr. B. S. Mallayya interrupting: ‘Who is to give the report of the School of Indian Medicine? Is it not the Surgeon-General?’) Of course all the Schools of Medicine are under the Minister and they form part of the Transferred departments; and they will be administered by the Minister with the permanent officers of Government. (Dr. B. S. Mallayya interrupting said: ‘What is the relation of the Surgeon-General to the School of Indian Medicine?’) If the hon. Member had raised this question during the debate, I might have been able to give a satisfactory answer, but certainly it cannot come in way of interruption when I am answering other questions.

“As regards rural dispensaries, these rural medical practitioners are being paid an annual allowance of Rs. 600 and provision has been made in the budget for 480 rural dispensaries, and I must say that in spite of efforts made by Government, the provision made even during the last year has not been exhausted, for it has not been possible to start the necessary institutions for which provision was made. I may assure hon. Members that during the next year all possible efforts will be made and I hope we will be able to establish all the 480 institutions for which provision has already been made in the budget. The hon. Member from Coimbatore wanted that encouragement should be given to these medical institutions. As the hon. the Raja of Kallikota has pointed out Rs. 360 is paid by the taluk boards for the purchase of drugs in these institutions. I am told that this Rs. 360 works out on an average at the rate of Rs. 30 per month and if even more money is required and the attendance in these hospitals is satisfactory and the people do derive benefit by this, probably this allowance of Rs. 360 may be increased too. There is nothing to prevent this. I should consider this is more than what is given in the municipal hospitals. (Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao: ‘That is also your subject’.)

“I may also say for the information of hon. Members that Government is taking steps to increase the teaching staff of the School of Indian Medicine by eleven and I may say it is quite adequate. An adequate provision has also been made in the budget for increase in the staff.

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

"The hon. Mr. Basheer Ahmad referred to the Herbarium and its unsatisfactory condition. A Superintendent has been appointed for taking charge of the Herbarium on what I should consider to be an adequate pay of Rs. 100 or Rs. 120. Hon. Members may know that this sort of Herbarium where medical plants can be reared and maintained is not an easy thing. This may in the course of a few years become a permanent Herbarium and will supply all the ordinary plants and herbs that may be required for the preparation of Indian and Unani medicines. With these few observations I must finally express my sympathy with the hon. Members of this House in their anxiety to improve Unani and Ayurvedic systems of medicine and hon. Members may rest assured that I will do everything possible for me to do or for the Government to do in this matter."

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—"I have been carefully listening to the Minister. He says he is going to increase the number of professors in the Indian School of Medicine, but taking the statistics I find that there are only two boys in each section. What is the use of increasing the number of teachers without increasing the number of boys? Then again it is an instance of an Allopathic doctor teaching Anatomy as well as midwifery in that school. It is a rule in the Medical College that a man who teaches Anatomy must not be allowed in the Maternity Hospital. I should warn the hon. Minister or the Government to see that no case of blood-poisoning takes place and the poor and innocent patients made to suffer."

"Coming to rural dispensaries, there has been persistent complaints made that money is not sufficient to give fractional doses to patients who go there. If the Government cannot do anything, at least they can cut off the number of hospitals which they are going to ask the taluk boards to start, and they can make a saving and from this saving they can give ample funds for the subsidized medical officers to do useful work. They have got certain complaints and they are putting it in the form of a memorial and will reach the Government in course of time."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The question is to reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,96,500 for pay of officers by Rs. 100."

The motion was put to the House and declared lost.

1-30
p.m.

A poll was demanded by Mr. Harisarvottama Rao and the House divided thus :—

Ayes.

1. Diwan Bahadur P. Kesava Pillai.
2. The Zamindar of Kallikota.
3. Saiyid Tajuddin Sahib Bahadur.
4. Mr. V. Ramjee Rao.
5. " Sami Venkatachalam Chetti.
6. " S. Satyamurti.
7. " C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar.
8. " T. Adinarayana Chettiayar.
9. " P. Anjaneyulu.
10. " J. A. Saldanha.
11. " C. S. Govindaraja Mudaliyar.
12. " G. Harisarvottama Rao.
13. Abdul Hamid Khan Sahib Bahadur.
14. Mr. K. V. R. Swami.

15. Dr. B. S. Mallayya.
16. Mr. K. R. Karant.
17. " C. Obi Reddi.
18. " C. Ramasomayajulu.
19. " Basheer Ahmad Sayeed.
20. " P. Bhaktavatsulu Nayudu.
21. " A. Kaleswara Rao.
22. " R. Srinivasa Ayyangar.
23. " K. Koti Reddi.
24. " L. K. Tulasiram.
25. " B. Ramachandra Reddi.
26. Rao Bahadur C. S. Ratnasabapati
Mudaliyar.
27. The Kumararaja of Venkatagi.i.

26th March 1928]

Noes.

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. The hon. Sir Norman Marjoribanks. | 19. Mr. J. Bheemayya. |
| 2. " Khan Bahadur Muhammad Usman Sahib Bahadur. | 20. " V. Ch. John. |
| 3. " Mr. T. E. Moir. | 21. Subadar-Major S. A. Nanjappa Bahadur. |
| 4. " " A. Y. G. Campbell. | 22. Mr. T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai. |
| 5. " " M. R. Seturatnam Ayyar. | 23. " K. Krishnan. |
| 6. " " S. Muthiah Mudaliyar. | 24. " N. Sivaraj. |
| 7. " Dr. P. Subbarayan. | 25. " L. C. Guruswami. |
| 8. Rao Bahadur C. V. Ananthakrishna Ayyar. | 26. " V. I. Muniswami Pillai. |
| 9. Mr. F. B. Evans. | 27. " W. P. A. Soundarapandia Nadar. |
| 10. " H. A. Watson. | 28. " M. A. Manikkavelu Nayakar. |
| 11. " G. T. Boag. | 29. " Syed Ibrahim Sahib. |
| 12. " A. McG. C. Tampoe. | 30. " G. R. Premayya. |
| 13. " S. H. Slater. | 31. Rao Sahib R. Srinivasan. |
| 14. " C. B. Cotterell. | 32. Mr. W. O. Wright. |
| 15. " R. Foulkes. | 33. Diwan Bahadur M. Krishnan Nayar. |
| 16. " Abbas Alikhan. | 34. Mr. T. K. Chidambaramatha Mudaliyar. |
| 17. " H. B. Ari Gowder. | 35. Abdul Razaack Sahib Bahadur. |
| 18. " A. B. Shetty. | 36. Mr. K. Sitarama Reddi. |
| | 37. " M. V. Gangadhara Siva. |

Ayes : 27. Noes : 37.

The motion was lost.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The question is that Government be granted a sum not exceeding Rs. 77·07 lakhs under Demand XX—Medical."

The demand was put to the House and carried, and the grant was made.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The Council will now adjourn and re-assemble at 2-30 p.m."

After Lunch (2-30 p.m.).

DEMAND XXI—PUBLIC HEALTH AND VITAL STATISTICS.

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Sir, on the recommendation of His Excellency the Governor, I move

'that the Government be granted a sum not exceeding Rs. 45,67,000 under Demand XXI—Public Health and Vital Statistics.'"

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The question is that Government be granted a sum not exceeding Rs. 45,67,000 under Demand XXI—Public Health and Vital Statistics."

* Mr. G. HARISARVOTTAMA RAO :—"Mr. President, Sir, I rise *'to move that the demand of Rs. 10,31,300 be reduced by Rs. 100.'*"

"My intention in moving this motion is, Sir, to urge the abolition of the Public Health Department as it is now constituted. The Public Health Department is a gilded mosquito, preying on the finances of the country. We have always statistics thrown in our faces. We are told, Sir, that certain figures are very favourable in regard to this Health Department. Vaccinations, so many thousands or so many lakhs, have been successfully carried out. Births and deaths have been successfully registered. That is the whole song of the Public Health Department. We are now and then reminded of the existence of this department by the fanfare that is made at the time of the Health Week. Agencies are brought into existence and heaven and earth are moved to make the Health Week a success amidst the din and dust of all cities. There is plenty of dust raised on that day both metaphorically and as

[Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

[26th March 1928]

an actual matter of fact. School children are taken round on dusty roads with flags to the credit of the Health Department, in the mufassal, my friend adds and truly also. Beyond that I do not see what the Health Department is really doing for us in this Presidency. There are what are called Health Inspectors. They are few in number compared to the necessities of the country. They are the old class of vaccinators. They were under the control of the District Medical Officers and they were doing exactly the same work that they are doing to-day under the District Medical Officers. We have a Director of Public Health, his assistants, specialists and special officers, their offices and the ambition in the Health Department is to devour the Medical Department into itself. All this we have, no doubt. But the Government has begun at the wrong end as in everything else. What is really required is the attention to the needs of the rural areas. The Director of Public Health does not attend to the needs of rural areas or the people in the rural areas. It is the official lower down, the poor Health Inspector who is burdened with duties in numbers and he is expected to discharge those duties only on paper and subject to the rules framed. He is a mere automaton, a machine that goes about and collects figures or makes reports. He has not got the life in him to do the work that is entrusted to him. He is not a live organism. He does not feel the great duty imposed on him. He cannot possibly be feeling it because under the financial conditions that obtain, with the existing system of Government, it is impossible really to make adequate provision for the health or the good of the people of this country. The whole money is eaten up at the top. The whole money is lost and the fate of the Health Department is equally that. The Directors, the higher officials and the higher hierarchy and all the specialists and other people apportion among themselves the money, of course, legally, technically legally. They are entitled to that amount technically and they apportion that amount between themselves and for work lower down there is not much left. And, in a vast country like this, where admittedly there is not enough of medical aid or sanitary advice that can be given there has not been serious attention bestowed upon the actual necessities of the situation. The Health establishments sometimes deliver lectures—propaganda work that is called—and I have myself attended these lectures. I have seen the films put upon the screen. I have heard speeches made in the streets of our small towns. What is it that they do it for? They do it for the mere number of it, for the mere account of it and for the mere statistics of it. Beyond that, there is nothing very interesting. Very few people—I may say, absolutely no people—of any decent standard attend these lectures or hear these speeches for the simple reason that these speeches and lectures are barren. There is nothing interesting about them except a dying man carried in a bier, except a person with a bottle of oil by his side or under a mosquito curtain, except a mosquito-proof house built for the rich. Nothing that would interest the common people is said or shown at the time of these speeches. I have myself taken part in some of these exhibitions and I find that even laymen like us may sometimes be able to do a little, but I find that the department in itself is unable to do anything that would induce the people to go either to these lectures or attend these meetings. Why waste all this money for the so-called Health Department? What is the benefit that is coming out of this department? Speaking of these lectures and speeches, I am convinced that no honest intelligent attempt

26th March 1928] [Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

is being made to develop the cultural life of the country, to give the people real and useful ideas. There is nothing interspersed in these lectures that would make the lectures interesting. Not one beautiful scene is shown. Not one beautiful temple is put on the screen. Not one beautiful passage from the country's ballads is shown on the screen. All these interspersed with scientific truths might attract people, might give them some real education. But not a thought is bestowed on these matters. Everything is done in a very mechanical way and that on the most meagre scale. Where are the lectures? Where are the lanterns? And, where are the slides? They are really scattered over the country in a few places and they come up only at the time of the so-called Health Week, because that Health Week is celebrated in the name of one of the biggest personages that adorned some Imperial status in this country. Except for this single fanfare that is held for a week in the year, I do not see that the Health Department deserves to exist at all. It does nobody any good. There is nothing in the Health Department's work that would help me to say, 'Here is the Health Department which is really doing good work.' But when I say that the Health Department should be abolished, I do not mean that the whole department should be abolished altogether. I do not mean that these statistics should be abolished, I do not mean that you should send away these men. My cut motion clearly says that the abolition of the Health Department 'as it is now constituted' is aimed at. I want service for the people. I do not want berths for specialists. I do not want berths for experts. Experts and specialists have their own places; that ought not to be the end and aim of Government policy in any department. And in the Health Department, I see nothing except the emoluments of experts and specialists. In spite of numbers of experts and specialists, very little literature is produced on health. I have not read nor have I heard of any such literature. I am a man that is very voracious in reading literature of any kind. I am a person who takes interest, though of course I am more wedded to the Ayurvedic system and have my own ways of thinking, in reading every bit of sanitary information that is given by the western scientists also. But I find that the Health Department is doing precious little except during that one week. During that week, some missionary organization appears to be very active and little leaflets published by the S.P.C.K. Press are distributed broadly and some of these posters published a few years ago, the ante-diluvian period of the Health Service. They are already printed and ready in the Government Press. These posters are got and pasted and there the whole responsibility of the Health Department seems to end.

"Sir, very little of non-official agency is used by the Health Department. 2-45
After all, the work of the Health Department will be impossible, will be next P.M.
to nothing, as long as the Government which is responsible for the development of the country does not think of the cultural development of the country, does not think of extending the knowledge of the people on a broad-based principle of expansion of education. Just fancy a Government refusing to accede to the demand of the Andhra University for extension work. That is an index of the expansion work that this Government is doing. There is no good of multiplying departments. I want, Sir, that the Health Inspectors should be under the District Medical Officers once again and that once again they should function as part of the Medical Department, and that this Public

[Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao] . [26th March 1928]

Health Department as a department should go, that more attention should be paid to rural needs and more money should be spent on the rural population than upon mere superior officers and superior posts.

"Sir, there may be some friends here who may tell us that with advancing times, it would be suicidal to give up the advanced improvements of scientific discoveries in the world. Sir, I am not against giving the people the benefits of the scientific advance that has been made; but I am against using razors to cut firewood. This country is a poor country, this country has been taxed to the utmost, and every pie that is spent in this country must be accounted for as being utilized for the benefit of the man in the village. As long as luxuries are thrown upon him in the name of departments which do not benefit him or improve him, I do not want those luxuries to be there. The luxuries are only for the gilded flies of the departments; let the gilded flies not be there. They are intended for doing rural work, and this rural work can be better done by the overpaid I.M.S. officer who occupies all the berths in the Medical Department."

* Mr. S. ARPUDASWAMI UDAYAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, the hon. Member has compared the Public Health Department to a gilded mosquito preying upon the finances of the province. Sir, there is some truth in that. What he meant was that the benefits of the department do not reach the masses. But that is not a justification for the abolition of the department. He himself spoke of the Health Week. Sir, Health Weeks held in different parts of the province have been a great success, success because they enlighten and educate the people, all classes of people, villagers, school-going children, student population. . . ."

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—"Blind people!"

* Mr. S. ARPUDASWAMI UDAYAR :—"And even doctors like my hon. Friend there, in regard to improved sanitation and health. Sir, more of these Health Weeks should be held not only in cities but also in some rural centres, and I believe they will be a powerful means of instructing the masses as to what they should do, what steps they should take, what means they should employ in order to improve their own health and the health of their neighbours. My friend also spoke of appeal to cultural life. Sir, it only means that there is not much co-operation between the public health officers and other agencies. For instance, if the educational authorities, if the school-masters in rural areas co-operate with the officers of the Public Health Department, certainly lectures can be arranged which will be far more interesting than those of which my hon. Friend spoke just a while ago, and the activities of the Health Department will penetrate the masses.

"Again, Sir, speaking of the Health Week, I know that what we want in this province is such kinds of popular demonstration. For a whole week, sometimes for even a fortnight, great preparations are made by non-official bodies, and we find large crowds resorting to the magic lantern lectures. Surely what they see with their own eyes and what they hear will not be lost upon them. Sir, instead of abolishing this department, what we must contend for is that there should be more liberal grants allotted for this department for carrying on its work satisfactorily. We should have larger establishments. We have at present perhaps one Inspector whose jurisdic-

26th March 1928] [Mr. S. Arpudaswami Udayar]

tion extends to about 60 villages. How can one man in times of cholera or some other epidemic do justice to his work and transport himself from place to place and how can he work a miracle of bilocation or trilocation at one and the same time? So, if we have more Inspectors and if their work is confined to certain specific localities, especially in times of epidemic such as cholera or relapsing fever, I think the department can do much better work on such occasions, and more useful work too.

"Sir, we were told that these Health Inspectors are recruited from the ranks of vaccinators. Sir, the vaccinators are doing very good work, and I think there are proposals to recruit Health Inspectors from L.M.Ps. I know that many of my friends are not satisfied with the propaganda work. Propaganda work is certainly very good, especially with regard to certain diseases like the hook-worm disease or the relapsing fever or even cholera when these Health officers go to different places and advise people as to what they should do, how they should take water for drinking purposes, how they should not take water from certain wells and how before taking water from certain wells, they should see that all the bacteria are killed. All these things are certainly beneficial so far as they go; but if in addition to this propaganda work, all these Inspectors have a good staff for giving all sorts of assistance to the people free of cost and of instructing them how they should use medicines, etc., many of the difficulties can be avoided and the health of the people, especially in times of epidemic, can be very much improved. Therefore, Sir, I think my friend who really felt that this department was not doing any good may take it from me that it will be made to do all the good it is capable of doing if, instead of its being abolished, the department is allotted larger amounts for larger establishments and a greater number of Health Inspectors who by coming often and often and more and more in contact with the people in the villages will certainly take better care of the sanitation and health of those villages."

Mr. K. V. R. SWAMI:—"I move, Mr. President, that the question be now put."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The hon. the Minister has not yet replied."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, I have been very carefully listening to the speech of the hon. Member for Kurnool, and I am afraid I devoted most of the time that he took in making his speech in thinking about what he meant by 'gilded mosquito'. I must confess, Sir, I was not able to quite catch the simile, but I tried my best to understand it. Perhaps what he meant was that these officials of the Public Health Department in the guise of doing good to the public were trying to eat away the money of the people just as mosquitoes. . . (Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao: 'Exactly'.) My hon. Friend assures me that I have been able to catch his meaning correctly; and if I did not catch the rest of what he said, he will kindly excuse me as I was thinking about this new phrase which he has coined."

"The hon. Member for Kurnool was saying that the Health Department is not doing any real good and that what should be done is to educate the masses, so that they may be able to understand the propaganda. Sir, I perfectly believe that every one in the Public Health Department recognizes this as one of his first duties and is doing a great deal in this direction."

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

These Health Inspectors of whom there are eight to fifteen in each of the districts are delivering lectures in various places. My hon. Friend said that these lectures are not attended by any decent men. Certainly, Sir, they are not attended by decent men because these lectures are delivered for the improvement and instruction of the ignorant masses in the villages. Decent men who know all these things already much better than the Health Inspectors themselves know—people like Mr. Harisarvottama Rao or for the matter of that any other hon. Member of this House, certainly will not derive any benefit by attending these lectures. But the question is whether the masses in the villages who know much less than what we do of the principles of hygiene and sanitation, appreciate these lectures and whether they understand them or not. (Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao: 'They don't.'). There is no good saying that they do not understand them. These lectures delivered in the villages are of an elementary nature. The Inspector says 'you must drink pure water. (Mr. S. Satyamurti: 'Let them get it; they don't want your water'.) Very well; let them not drink dirty water till they get good water. I think that is a very wholesome advice. This is the nature of the lectures delivered in the villages, and I am not surprised at the fact that many people of culture and education do not go and attend them. But I do not at the same time believe that these lectures are unnecessary and that they do not serve any useful purpose. My hon. Friend said that the lectures with lantern slides are very much in progress during the Health Week and that at other parts of the year they are not delivered at all. It may be so in some districts, and if any hon. Member of this House comes across any delinquent who does not do his duty properly—it is up to him to bring it to the notice of the authorities—certainly due notice will be taken of such delinquencies. But to say that they are not doing their duty properly, without citing any instance, is not fair. Perhaps what the hon. Member meant was—as Mr. Arpudaswami Udayar said—that these people ought to do their duties more satisfactorily and in a more efficient manner. If only the hon. Member in the course of his speech had suggested any constructive proposal as to what should be done, certainly, we would have been able to consider it; but Government, after the speech of the hon. Member, are left to their own resources and they have themselves to find out, to the best of their lights, what should be done to improve matters. Certainly, the Government will consider in what directions the administration of the Health Department can be improved. May I say, Sir, that during the course of the last year, more than 30,000 lectures were delivered in all the districts, and that the average attendance in each one of these lectures was from 30 to 50. I must say, Sir, that in these villages an audience of 50 is really a great thing, and if people were not really interested in what they heard, they won't have gathered there at all.

"Then the hon. Member was saying that there is no good of the department and that the people must be given what they want. Let us know what the people want. What they want is good health. (Mr. Satyamurti: 'People want good food, etc.'). If the hon. Member will bring forward a scheme by which the Government can undertake to give them a good supply of food, certainly I will be the first to jump at it."

MR. S. SATYAMURTI :—"Swaraj will give them food; cross the floor. That is the only scheme."

26th March 1928]

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"I am not perfectly sure, Sir, if my hon. Friend can be so sanguine of supplying good food to the people during the Swaraj regime. (Mr. Satyamurti: 'Why so?') Because I have had a fore, taste of what the Swaraj Government will be. (Mr. Satyamurti: 'What is it?') Now I have been made to refer to it I shall amplify it if there is no interruption from the Opposite side. I don't think it is necessary to drag 3 p.m. this into this discussion but since I have been forced to refer to it I shall say that the Swarajists are not willing to take up the responsibility; and the latest specimen is the speech of the hon. Member for the University."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"Order, order. The hon. Member is not in order."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"I thoroughly understand that it is not quite pertinent to the subject, but I have been forced to refer to it because of the interruptions."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"I will advise the hon. Member not to mind the interruptions."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"I shall not refer to the interruptions provided the hon. Members do not take it as an insult and think that I had not the courtesy to reply to them."

"The whole department has been doing its work and if the House is disposed to believe me, it is doing more good to the country than it is generally believed. The death-rate in 1926 is 26.9 and in 1927 it is 24.9. The birth-rate now is 36.5; so that during the course of a year the birth-rate exceeds death-rate by 12.4; that is to say, in one year the increase in population is $1\frac{1}{4}$ per cent; so that in one census the population of the province will exceed, without taking into consideration extraneous causes like emigration, etc., by about $12\frac{1}{2}$ per cent or one-eighth."

Mr. G. HARISARVOTTAMA RAO :—"Quite certain of statistics?"

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"If the hon. Member says the statistics are wrong, he will have to support his argument by facts."

"If hon. Members think that the figures I give are not correct . . ."

Mr. S. SATYAMURTI :—"We don't agree with your figures."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"Order, order."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"The Health staff in each of the districts are attending the fairs and festivals in the villages and they are doing everything in their power to prevent the outbreak and spread of epidemics. I quite concede that this department could do more but there is no meaning in saying that because it has not done what it could have done therefore it should be abolished."

* Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—"I have listened with interest to the speech of the hon. Minister for Public Health. Sir, he has made out a fine case for the department of which he is in charge. But I am afraid that because he is in possession of statistics of the good work that his department is doing, it does not go a long way for the continuance of the department. We the Indian medical practitioners will rather see the medical department now under Government control being placed under the Director of Public Health, just as

[Dr. B. S. Mallayya]

[26th March 1928]

it is done in other countries. The Surgeon-General is a military officer and he is out of place there. And I am sure the hon. Minister has no control over him. If at all there is any control it will be that of the Surgeon-General over the hon. Minister."

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" I am afraid the hon. Member will be quite in order if he refers to the Director of Public Health, instead of referring to the Surgeon-General." (Laughter.)

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" I am telling how the Director of Public Health aims at good work being done. I have been in the Public Health Department and I know what line of action is pursued by them. For one thing their attention is not drifted away by private practice. (Hear, hear). Reference was made to the vaccination work. If there is anything done in the medical world which protects the people from blindness, lameness, etc., it is the vaccination which acts as a protection against the much dreaded disease of small pox. Coming to the epidemic diseases, cholera was a terror and a nightmare to the people; but under the fine organization of the Public Health Department and the latest discovery of inoculation for cholera this dire disease is not promoted. The most important duty of the Health Department is to provide pure drinking water; and it is my firm conviction that if adequate steps are taken to provide every village with pure drinking water there will be no necessity for any staff on whom lakhs and lakhs of rupees are spent to stamp out diseases. If such sums are pent in matters of public sanitation, conservancy, prevention of disease, etc., it will give a better return and it will be better appreciated by the Public Health Department. And I am sure this will be supported by all medical private practitioners."

* Mr. T. M. NARAYANASWAMI PILLAI :—" Mr. President, Dr. Mallayya has answered the criticism levelled by my hon. Friend, Mr. G. Harisarovattama Rao. When he was speaking I was wondering whether he was pleading for the strengthening of the establishment or for its abolition. To me it appears that he was really for strengthening the department. He said :—" No doubt there is much to be done by the Health Department. As it is, it has not done enough, therefore abolish it." This is bad reasoning. While the hon. Minister was speaking the hon. Member for University exclaimed ' Give us water.' In some of our places the difficulty is not so much about the supply of water as about the knowledge of people as to what has to be done to make the water good and fit for drinking. I come from the Lalgudi taluk where there was an outbreak of cholera. And in one month there were about 750 attacks; and but for the activities of the Public Health Department and the timely steps taken by the District Board the disease would have wrought havoc. The Health Department took steps to see that every village well was disinfected and the people were supplied with disinfected water. In our village the difficulty is not want of water but the real difficulty is the ignorance of the people in taking bad water. There is a channel near by from which they have been taking water customarily. If the people had drunk the water after boiling it there would have been no disease. But the people were ignorant of this and it was the Public Health Department that taught the people to take boiled water. I am alive to the necessity of and the useful work done by this department and I feel there is no use decrying this department. As a matter of fact this department is carrying knowledge to the homes of the people as to how to lead a clean, pure and healthy life. This

26th March 1928] [Mr. T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai]

department has undertaken to do work with a limited finance and it is doing excellent work. Therefore we ought to do our best to see that this department is placed on a satisfactory basis. I do not think there is any virtue in crying for the abolition of this department. Our aim should be to strengthen it. Hence I oppose the motion."

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" Sir, I move that the question be now put."

The motion for closure was put and carried.

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" The question is to reduce the allotment of Rs. 10,31,300 for Public Health establishments by Rs. 100."

The motion was put to vote and lost.

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—" Sir, I beg to move
'to reduce the allotment of Rs. 10,31,300 for Public Health establishments by Rs. 100', to point out the backwardness and defects of the sanitary system in the Presidency as a whole.

"In drawing the attention of the House to some of the defects of the present system I shall read one passage from the book 'India in Transition' by H. H. the Aga Khan: 'Now British rule in India has been criticised, and rightly criticised, for having allowed the twentieth century to dawn and grow without having grappled fully and successfully with the illiteracy general in India, and with the insanitary environment of the masses so bad that avoidable deaths are counted by the million every year, while the standard of the physique of the masses is deplorably low.'"

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" Is the hon. Member justified in reading a passage from an extraneous book?" (Laughter.)

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Yes."

Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—" This passage has bearing on the subject. These words coming from no less a personage than His Highness the Aga Khan are beyond dispute. I am not here to lecture on the defects arising from social customs; for that the forum is different. But in this forum I may show how far Government are responsible for the present defects.

"One of the important things is water-supply. The Government is very slow in the matter of providing adequate water-supply. Take the case of Mangalore, for instance. On the mere survey of our water-supply scheme thousands of rupees have been spent and the preliminary investigation has been going on for the last 15 or 16 years. As yet we are not near the end. We do not know how long we shall have to wait. The predecessor of the present Minister came to Mangalore and I took special trouble to take him to the site of the water-supply project though it was not in his original programme and pointed out to him where the investigation was made. He promised to look into the matter and expedite the water-supply scheme. I do not know whether anything has been done to expedite the preliminary investigation. With all our efforts—we are ourselves doing much and we have a Health and Welfare Association of which I am myself the President—it is very difficult to considerably decrease the infant mortality which stands at 125. Of course Madras is much worse and its rate is 250."

Dr. B. S. MALLAYYA :—" 350."

3-15
p.m.

[26th March 1928]

* **Mr. J. A. SALDANHA** :—" Though in Mangalore it is only 125, it is still abnormally high compared with the rate of infant mortality in Europe and even in London. That is enough to show how backward our system is. It is not merely the fault of the people. One of the remedies is to carry out town-planning schemes for all largely populated villages. In this matter Government have been very slow. The Town-Planning Act need not be confined to towns alone ; it may be applied to villages also. I brought to the notice of the Government the case of a village which is affected by floods year after year and asked them to have a town-planning scheme for that place and shift the site of the village to a higher level. Government have been absolutely indifferent to this. The scheme of the Act is very comprehensive and includes water-supply, roads and so on. It would conduce to the improvement of the health of our people if the scheme of the Act is applied to unions and villages. I do not understand why the Government should not take into consideration the suggestion made by an hon. Member of this House who has had experience of town-planning and land-acquisition scheme in Bombay. I do not see why the Government should not bring pressure on its officials to apply the Town-Planning Act to a large village like Bantwal. If the Government do not adopt this suggestion of mine, I will press this point and urge this on the hon. Minister again and again until this Act is extended. It will be very useful if one or two villages are brought under this Act and made into model villages. Why should the Government turn a deaf ear to my suggestion ? I hope the hon. Minister, with a wider outlook on the subject, will be bold enough to face the situation and see that the Act which has not been made use of, is made use of properly. This Act had not been made use of for Mangalore at all. My hon. Friend Mr. Karant and myself and others are working to extend to all parts of the town the benefits of the Act. We must take the bull by its horns. We want to see that the sanitation in the villages is improved by applying the provisions of this important Act."

* **Mr. K. R. KARANT** :—" Mr. President, Sir, I had no idea of speaking on this motion, because the terms of the motion were so wide that I did not think that town-planning would actually come within its terms. Now that the hon. Member Mr. Saldanha has spoken on it I wish to add a few words to what he has said."

* **The hon. the PRESIDENT** :—" The salary of the Town-Planning Officer is included in that item."

* **Mr. K. R. KARANT** :—" The attention given by the Government to this department seems to be very inadequate. I am told that when the Justice Ministry was in power something tangible was done ; but ever since that time, I am sorry to say, and I speak with some knowledge, that nothing has been done to improve the Town-planning department. Take, for instance, Mangalore, where we are doing a little spade work. We wanted the department to give us hands to work out town-planning. Our people cannot do it. Government is not in a position to give us hands even though we are prepared to pay their salaries. I would therefore suggest to the hon. Minister to train up half a dozen hands, say at Rs. 100 a month, to actually work out schemes instead of the Act remaining a dead letter as it is now. They may train some hands and ask the municipalities to take them up and work out the schemes. I hope this will be done."

26th March 1928]

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—“ Mr President, Sir, the Government will certainly devote its attention to the suggestion of the hon. Member Mr. Saldanha and of Mr. Karant. I have not yet thoroughly gone through the provisions of the Act to say anything as regards its application to the villages. As to what the feeling of the villagers will be in the matter of the application of the Act, I am not in a position to venture an opinion at present; because the Act imposes certain liabilities and responsibilities and whether the people affected are willing to undertake them or not is a question which has to be examined. For I find that in certain places, though the people know that if that place is declared to be a municipality it would bring them improved sanitation and improved health, they are yet averse to that step because it would touch their pockets. Similarly, the people in the villages may object to the application of the Town-Planning Act. This is a matter which requires consideration by the local authorities and the people concerned and Mr. Saldanha and Mr. Karant will have a determining voice in the application of the Act to that district.

“As regards the investigation of the Mangalore water-supply scheme, if the hon. Member had referred to this in his token motion I would have been able to give him some specific answer. But I was unable to understand from the nature of the cut motion what exactly was the intention of the hon. Member in giving notice of this cut. Now that he has referred to the Mangalore water-supply scheme that question will be investigated and due attention will be paid to the suggestion of the hon. Mover and Government will see that there is no avoidable delay in the matter.”

The motion was by leave withdrawn.

Mr. S. VENKIAH in moving the following motion spoke in Telugu :—

‘ That the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for public health purposes be reduced by Rs. 100 ’ to discuss the desirability of improving water-supply to depressed classes of rural areas, and to safeguard them from obstruction of using public wells and tanks.

“ నిమ్మ జాతులయొక్క ఆరోగ్యము, లోపభూయిష్టమైయున్న సంగతి ప్రభుత్వము వారికి తెలిసిన విషయమే. వారి పల్లెలు ఆనారోగ్య ప్రదేశములయందు నిర్మితమయియున్నవి. ఇంట్లు ఒక దానితో నొకటి అంటియిండుట. ఇండ్ల చుట్టు పెంటకుప్పలు, ఇరుకు సందులు మంచిగాలి వచ్చుటకును, చెరుగాలి పోవుటకును ఎదురెదురుగా కిటికీలు ఉండవు. వంటచేయు నప్పుడు పొగ బయటపోకుండా ఇండ్లనుండి వ్యాపించి అట్టి తరి యొడ్లలో మనుష్యులుండుట కేంతమాత్రం వీలు ఉండదు. గ్రామములచుట్టు మురికి నీటి గుంటలు. ఆ మురికినీరు పోవు టకు మార్గములు ఉండవు. గాన దొరతనమువారు కొన్ని ప్రదర్శన పల్లెలు (model villages) నిర్మించివారికి ఆరోగ్యమును ప్రదర్శించు, ఇంట్లు కట్టించి కొన్ని వాడుచాలమీద వాటి కిమ్మత్తులు తీర్చుకొనే పద్ధతిమీద వారికి యివ్వవలయును. ఆరోగ్య శాఖాధికారులు నాగరిక ఆరోగ్యవ్యవస్థలను పట్టణములలో ఉపన్యాసము లిచ్చుటవలన శ్రయోజనము లేదు. ఇట్టి ఆనారోగ్యములగు పల్లెలకు తరుదుగా బోయి మ్యాజిక్ లాంతరు ప్రదర్శనముల మూలమున ప్రబోధము గావింపవలయును.

“ నీటిపంపి (water-supply).—లోకల్ బోర్డు మ్యునిసిపాలిటీలన్నూ లేబరు.డిపార్టు మెంటువారున్నూ, అచ్చటన్నట కొన్ని నీటి సదుపాయములు చేసియున్నారు. ఇది బహు స్వల్పము. చెరువులుగాని, సూతులుగాని, నీటి సదుపాయము కొరకు విచ్చాటు చేయవలసి

[Mr. S. Venkiah]

[26th March 1928]

నిమ్మజాతుల పల్లెలనేకములు. ప్రతి తాలూకాలోను ఉన్నవి. గ్రామములమట్టా నిలచియుండు నీటిపోవుట కెట్టి సదుపాయములులేవు లోకల్ బోర్డులవల్ల నిర్మించబడిన చెరువులు నూతులలో సకలజాతులు నీళ్లు వాడుకొనవచ్చునని ప్రభుత్వ ప్రకటన ఉన్నప్పటికిని, ఆగ్రజాతులవారి ప్రాబల్యముచే యీ జాతులవారిని చేరినివ్వడములేదు. ఇట్టి సంస్థలలో ప్రవేశించుటకు ప్రతిబోటు బోర్డుల కట్టించవలెను. ప్రతి రెవిన్యూ ఆఫీసరు గ్రామములను దర్శించునపుడు సదరు సంస్థలలో ప్రవేశపెట్టుటకు సహాయపడుచుండవలయును. ప్రతి రెవిన్యూ ఆఫీసరు, నూతులు, చెరువులు లేనట్టియు, నివేశ్త సంస్థలులేనట్లు ప్రజలుగల పల్లెలల్నియును తయారుచేసి ప్రభుత్వము వారికిని లోకల్ బోర్డుల ప్రసిద్ధింపజేయుటకును తెలుపుచుండవలయును.

“అంటువ్యాధులు.— మహాది, వివక్షిరములు, కలరా, మొదలగు వ్యాధులు క్రమబద్ధము ఈ దురిదృష్టవంతుల పల్లెలయందు ప్రవేశించి రోగ్యాత్ నాగరిక పల్లెలకున్నూ, పట్టణములకున్నూ వ్యాపించి సర్వజనులకు ఆరిష్టదాయకములగుచున్నవి గాన, నిమ్మజాతుల యారోగ్యమును కాపాడుట, సర్వజన శ్రేయోదాయకమైనది. కాబట్టి ఆరోగ్య శాఖామంత్రి గారు నిమ్మజాతులవారి ఆరోగ్యమును కాపాడుటకు తగు చర్య తీసుకొనుటకై యీ 100 రూపాయలను తగ్గింపు గోరుచున్నాను.”

3-30
P.M.

* Mr. V. I. MUNISWAMI PILLAI :—“Mr. President, Sir, time and again on the floor of this House we, Members representing the depressed classes, have impressed on the Government the necessity for making enough provision for digging more wells. I know, Sir, as a matter of fact that this Government are trying to do something to relieve depressed classes from this grievance. What happens is a major portion of the money set apart for digging wells is used for paying the staff. We really get very little money out of the amount allotted for digging wells. I have been visiting a number of rural areas. There is a great cry for adequate water-supply. I know of instances where women and children have to wait for half a day or more for a potful of water. It is very necessary that the very element for existence should not be denied to the depressed classes by spending more money on the staff. I appeal to the Government to set apart a large sum of money to provide wells for the depressed classes in districts where the activities of the Labour department have not been extended. Recently I was touring in Malabar and I found a large number of wells dug by my people, but the water was unfit to be drunk even by animals. Though there are a few wells there they are not in a good condition. On behalf of the depressed classes I once again impress upon the Government that they must take keen interest in the matter of water-supply in the rural areas.”

* Mr. M. V. GANGADHARA SIVA :—“Mr. President, Sir, times without number, discussion has taken place on the floor of this House as regards the need of water and wells for drinking purposes. I wish to know whether the Government are taking steps to put a stop to the restrictions on the use of public wells and tanks by members of the depressed classes. All public wells and tanks constructed with public money should be open to every tax-payer and to every citizen. The Government should provide decent wells to the depressed classes. I am afraid that the Government have been very nervous in taking stringent measures to see that no depressed class people are obstructed from taking water from public wells. Even under the present law it is possible for these poor and helpless people to assert their rights and get influential caste brethren convicted in courts of law. It is absolutely necessary that the Government should see that the depressed classes do not suffer

26th March 1928]

[Mr. M. V. Gangadhara Siva]

for want of drinking water. As regards Ceded districts the depressed classes people suffer very much because the Government have not provided for water-supply to them. Cuddapah suffers most in any summer season. In this part of the year the depressed class people have to go to a river to get water and they have to dig for hours together before they can get a small quantity of water and that too full of dirt. That is how the Ceded districts people suffer much in summer season. I therefore request the Government to see that some arrangements are made for providing wells to the depressed classes, especially in the Ceded districts."

* Diwan Babadur P. KESAVA PILLAI :—" Mr. President, Sir, I quite agree with my hon. Friends, the representatives of the depressed classes, that there is a great need for providing wells for the depressed classes in many villages, especially in the Ceded districts. In some villages there are only one or two wells and those for the caste people only, and the depressed classes have no wells at all. The Government have been giving small doles of grants to local bodies every year for providing wells to the depressed classes. I have been in charge of local boards for many years and I know that no separate grant is given for this purpose. What we want is more money so that we may spend it for digging wells. Most of the local bodies have got estimates ready for digging wells. But money is not forthcoming. When grants are made, they are not made in the beginning of the year but only in the latter part of the year. The grants lapse because we are not able to spend the money before the close of the year.

"As regards public wells, I do not think the Government can interfere. Public opinion has to be educated; people have to be enlightened to allow other classes also to draw water from public wells. No doubt, caste people draw a line between wells and water-taps at railway stations and towns. The pipe is open to all; all are taking water from pipes. The best way for the Government to help the people is to give more money to the local bodies. I know the Labour department has been contributing money for construction of wells, but not enough.

"I would request the Government to take a long view of the sanitary measures that are required to improve the condition of the depressed classes. Most of the depressed classes live in insanitary conditions amidst prickly-pears or near ponds containing stagnant rain-water. The ponds are breeding grounds for mosquitoes and epidemics. Some of the local bodies are doing a good deal of propaganda work. The Government should give grants to the local bodies to remove prickly-pears, and improve sanitation. My District Board has instituted prizes to the value of Rs. 15, 10 and 5 to be given to the primary schoolmasters to write essays in easy readable Telugu so as to be understood by the villagers for extirpating prickly-pear and promoting sanitation in the villages. Water and healthy surroundings are sorely needed and the Government will have to find ways and means to make larger grants to be spent on these improvements of vital importance to the life of the people."

* Mr. G. HARISARVOTTAMA RAO :—" Mr. President, Sir, I thought that a civilized Government which has a Labour department would take particular care of a problem like this. The futility of the department is clear from the manner in which the depressed classes are pining for water. In my districts, I have the misfortune to see our friends of the depressed classes being put to

[Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

[26th March 1928]

the necessity of waiting for hours to get a potful of water from the hands of a casteman. They are not allowed to take water from the wells which belong to castemen. There is very little of water in the Ceded districts. The Government have not made it a part of their policy first of all to attend to the necessity of supplying drinking water to the depressed classes and to completely carry out that programme within the shortest possible period. Water is a primary necessity. We are delivering lectures on the necessity of the depressed classes being clean. How can the depressed classes be clean when they do not get water for drinking, much less to wash themselves? Go to any village in the Ceded districts—I speak with complete knowledge—and you will find that there is not sufficient water for the depressed classes to drink. Where is water for them to cleanse themselves? What is the good of talking to them about sanitation? What is the use of delivering lectures to them that there is a paternal Government which maintains a department to raise the standard of these people? The first necessity is water. When this first necessity is denied to these classes of people, where is the talk of improvement? Have the Government honestly attempted to make provision for this? What has become of the remitted portion of the provincial contribution? All that has gone into the melting pot. The depressed classes are where they were. The Labour department is only a gilded show. There is no real substance. That moment would be the best moment when my depressed classes brethren would make bold in the most non-violent way to non-co-operate even with the castemen and get their rights established in the villages. I would stand by them and I want them to stand by themselves. I want the Government to help them. The Government do not do anything of the kind. The Government will not help the depressed classes.

“What are the poor local bodies to do? We have heard the speech of one of the district board presidents. He thinks that the contributions given to them are very little and insufficient. The local bodies are unable to make provision for all the numerous people inhabiting every village. In every village you have depressed classes. In every village there is necessity to supply them drinking water. Estimates are ready; where is the money? Are the Government ready with money? The Government should have a policy and they must complete the scheme within as short a time as possible. They must complete the scheme within two years from to-day. Let them make a promise to-day. Are the Government prepared to spend money upon that scheme? Then we can speak of the usefulness of the Labour department. The Labour department is extending its arms in every direction except in the direction, which is most essential, of providing for water. We cannot talk of the clearing of prickly-pear when these poor people have not got as much as one cupful of water for drinking at the proper moment. Suppose a member of a family is suffering from cholera in the hut. There may be only one other member in the family. He has to go to the well and wait there for a long time till water is poured into his vessel by a casteman. What pangs the individual member of the family attacked by cholera has to suffer are known only to God above and to the suffering poor. These are small things and these small things are things that really matter.

“These are vital things and I wish that in the matter of rural water-supply the needs of the depressed classes are completely attended to with the surplus money of the Government. Money is not available for any good purpose of the country, neither for the rural water-supply, nor for the depressed classes,

26th March 1928] [Mr. G. Harisarvottama Rao]

nor for prohibition, nor for anything good. It is available for the needs of the department. Money is available for the higher officers for their pay, for Secretaries, Superintendents and what not. It is there that the hypocrisy of the system of Government is exposed. Let my depressed classes brethren remember that if the Government mean well by them this question of the drinking-water supply can be solved within the next year. I hope that this motion will not be withdrawn at the dictation of the bureaucratic Government."

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—"I was rather astonished to hear the speech of my hon. Friend Mr. Harisarvottama Rao, because so far as I know the difficulties of the depressed classes arise more from caste objections than anything else. This difficulty is the same with the depressed classes in this Presidency as well as the sister Presidency. When there are two or three wells in a village, even cattle are allowed to drink water there. But the members of the depressed classes are not allowed to drink even from the water-trough in which cattle drink. They are treated as beasts and worse than beasts. I was astonished at the eloquence of my hon. Friend, because our caste system is more responsible for the troubles and difficulties of the depressed classes than the Government. (Laughter.)

"It is no use blaming only the Labour department, because we ourselves are partly responsible for the trouble. It is a question of cost. Where is the money for large special grants for wells for particular castes to the exclusion of others? My Christian brethren are of the same kind. We have got our own castes. There are Christians on this side of India who deny the right of water and the right of entry into certain churches to the out-caste Christians. It is a cry in the wilderness to go on talking about defects of water-supply without eliminating one of the main causes which are responsible for them, viz., the baneful effect of the caste intolerance. We must do away with such things and bring in a Bill for opening the public places including wells to all. This is one of the solutions to the difficulty and the next solution is where there are no wells, to provide new wells in proportion to the population without distinction of caste. With these few words, I hope this motion will be pressed."

* சுவாமி A. S. சகஜானந்தம் பேசியதாவது :—"உயிருக்கு ஆதரவாக உள்ளது தண்ணீர். நல்ல தண்ணீர் கிடைக்காமையாலேயே நோய்களுண்டாகின்றன. எங்கள் ஜனங்களுக்கு நல்ல தண்ணீர் கிடைப்பது மிகவும் அருமையாயிருக்கிறது. எங்கெங்கு கிராமத்தாருக்கு எங்கள் ஜனங்கள் மீது வருத்தம் உண்டாகிறதோ அங்கு தண்ணீரிருக்கும் குளம், ஆறு, ஏரி முதலானவைகளுக்குப் போகும் வழியில் முள் போட்டுத் தடுத்து விடுகிறார்கள். இவ்வாறு பல இடங்களில் நிகழ்கின்றன. பொதுக் குளம், கிணறு முதலானவைகளில் தண்ணீர் எடுத்துக்கொள்ளலாம் என்று அரசாங்கத்தார் சட்டம் இயற்றியிருக்கிறார்கள். ஆனால் அது அனுபவத்தில் நடைபெறவில்லை. சிதம்பரத்திற்கு கிழக்கே மகத்துவாழ்க்கையென்னும் ஊரிருக்கிறது. அங்கு, ஊரில் தாலாகா போட்டு குளத்தில் ஆகிராவிடர்கள் தண்ணீர் எடுத்துக்கொள்வார்கள். கிராமத்தாருக்கு ஏற்பட்ட மனக்கசப்பால் தற்போது தண்ணீர் எடுக்கவொட்டாமல் தடுத்துவிட்டார்கள். கனம் லேபர் கமிஷனர் எல்விஸ் துரையாவுர்கள்

[Swami A. S. Sahajanandam] [26th March 1928]

சென்று நேரில் பார்வையிட்டார். அது விஷயம் ஒன்றும் முடிவு பெறவில்லை. அரசாங்கத்தார் பணச்செலவிட்டு எடுக்கும் கிணறுகளும் முழு மோசமாயிருக்கிறது. தாலுகா போர்டார் பல கிணறுகள் வெட்டியுள்ளார். அவை தற்போது பாழடைந்து கிடக்கின்றன. லேபர் டிபார்ட்மெண்டிலும் கிணறுகள் வெட்டி வருகிறார்கள். அவைகளில் ஆரவறு மாதத்தில் தண்ணீர் இருப்பதில்லை.

“ லேபர் டிபார்ட்மெண்டும், தாலுகா போர்டும் பணம் செலவழித்தும் பயன்படவில்லை. ஓவாச்சியர்களை வசப்படுத்திக்கொண்டு குத்தகை எடுப்பவர் நானாறு ரூபாய்கள் ஜாபிதா போட்ட கிணற்றை, தூற்றை பது ரூபாய்களில் வெட்டினால் எவ்வாறு ஜலம் கிடைக்கும்? மேல் அதிகாரிகள், வெட்டிய கிணறுகளை அடிக்கடி மேல் பார்க்கவேண்டும்; வெட்டும் கிணறுகளைத் திறமாக வெட்டவும், கட்டவும் பார்க்கவேண்டும்.”

* Mr. S. ARPUDASWAMI UDAYAR :—“ Mr. President, Sir, the depressed classes are subject to many disadvantages even in towns. There are municipalities which have a protected water-supply. But unfortunately even in those municipalities they grudge to open one or more taps in cheris. I was instrumental in moving a resolution for having one or two taps opened in cheris. That resolution has not yet been given effect to. I know that, at the recent cholera outbreak, many of the members of the depressed classes were victims and the reason of cholera outbreak among them was that they were in the habit of taking the dirty water of the Uyyakondan channel into which sewage water is allowed to flow. Every municipality which has a protected water-supply is surely guilty of a great dereliction of duty if it does not open taps in cheris. We have taps in gardens and the whole day we find water wasted. Are not human beings far more precious than plants and trees? As regards wells, I think last year, on the floor of the House, I made this remark which was agreed to by the then Minister for Public Health, viz., that we should have block allotments made for the digging of wells and the moneys should be invested and spent according as the estimates were ready and could be given effect to. I should like to ask what steps have been taken. I am sure many members of the taluk boards will support me when I say that small sums are doled out which are hardly sufficient to keep the existing wells under repair. Then what about new wells, especially in places where there are no wells for the benefit of the depressed classes? Thirdly I find several taluks where even castemen are labouring under the same difficulties. They sail in the same boat as the depressed classes. There is no well and there is no water in tanks. I know of places in the Tanjore taluk where even now there is no water. I believe there are people going three miles and four miles with their vessels in one or two bullock-carts and they take sometimes half a day to fetch water. I have heard of a story that some of them were overtaken by night by robbers and were robbed of their vessels. The ex-Minister for Agriculture appointed a committee in order to try the experiment of sinking wells and of boring for the purpose of seeing whether water was available in certain localities for drinking purposes. Some such survey ought to be undertaken without delay. The proposal I made for having some lump grants or block grants allotted for the purpose ought to be adopted without any delay. Fourthly it is possible even in parts where there are no tanks for a good supply being assured by the Irrigation department, if they only act more

26th March 1928] [Mr. S. Arpudaswami Udayar]

sympathetically without paying attention to the letter of the law. In this connexion I am reminded of the story of Paramata Guru whose turban fell down and the disciples would not touch it because it was not stated in the rules that the disciples should take it. Likewise you find the channels overflowing with flood water at a distance of a few miles with which it is possible to have one or two fillings of several tanks. But the departmental engineers will not do this. The engineers ought to adopt this policy as a special case to allow the filling up once or twice at least during flood time when the water is wasted into the sea. That is the situation in the Tanjore taluk and I challenge the Minister to go and visit several villages where he will find villagers including caste men suffering for want of drinking water. Therefore, Sir, I think that something should be done without any further delay in order to relieve them from this difficulty, to relieve the distress of the depressed classes and also a large number of the caste men."

The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, Government themselves are fully conscious of the difficulties people are put to, not only the depressed classes, but people of all castes, for want of drinking water. As Mr. Saldanha and other Members pointed out, the difficulties are in some measure due to the higher castes themselves. But there is absolutely no excuse for Government saying because the higher caste people throw in difficulties they shall not take up that work. It is the duty of the Government to provide the villagers with good drinking water. Government is moving in this direction. During 1928-29 a grant of 13 lakhs has been made in the budget for improving the water-supply in municipalities. I suppose if the water-supply in municipalities is improved and the people of the place have adequate supply, the members of the depressed classes of these localities will also get the benefit of it. If there is any undue obstruction to these people getting adequate water it is up to hon. Members to move in the matter as far as they are concerned.

"The grant of 7 lakhs was made to the Madras municipality for improving the water-supply and if the supply is increased the depressed classes will get the benefit of it. 4 p.m.

"There is one other thing. The Government is making grants to the district boards for the purpose of providing a good water-supply. I find during the last two years the district boards have not been able to utilize all the moneys and more than half the amount has lapsed. Then during the current year owing to some circumstance or other they are not able to carry out the conditions of the grant. (A voice : 'Late contribution.') The conditions imposed by the Government are that they must complete the work within the year. If within the year they do not complete the work and if a board applies for a regrant, certainly the Government will have no objection to regrant it next year. They do grant it. For the current year about 8½ lakhs has been provided for the improvement of water-supply in rural areas, of which 7½ lakhs is for non-panchayat areas and 1·20 lakhs for panchayat areas. If these local bodies and the village panchayats utilize the amount without allowing it to lapse and undertake any work and carry it out, I am perfectly sure that Government will make at least an equal amount, if not a greater amount in the next Budget, for the purpose of improving water-supply. But I perfectly realize that with these grants the difficulties of the people cannot be removed in the course of a year or two. But the effort of the Government will be to improve the water-supply in the course of a few

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

years or as early as possible and to give good drinking water to all classes of people without any distinction whatever. I request, as Mr. Saldanha has stated, that the higher classes of people will not put unnecessary restrictions on depressed classes taking water from a good source of water-supply."

Mr. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—"I move, Sir, that the question be now put."

The motion for closure was put and adopted.

The original motion was then put and declared lost.

Mr. Satyamurti demanded a poll, and the House divided as follows :—

Ayes.

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Mr. S. Venkayya. | 12. Dr. B. S. Mallayya. |
| 2. " S. Arpudawami Udayar. | 13. Mr. K. R. Karant. |
| 3. Swami A. S. Sahajanandan. | 14. " C. Obi Reddi. |
| 4. Mr. V. Ramjee Rao. | 15. " C. Ramasomayajulu. |
| 5. " S. Satyamurti. | 16. Basheer Ahmad Sayeed Sahib Bahadur. |
| 6. " C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar. | 17. Mr. P. Bhaktavatsulu Nayudu. |
| 7. " J. A. Saldanha. | 18. " A. Kaeswara Rao. |
| 8. " G. Harisaravottama Rao. | 19. " R. Srinivasa Ayyangar. |
| 9. Abdul Hamid Khan Sahib Bahadur. | 20. " K. Koti Reddi. |
| 10. Mr. K. V. R. Swami. | 21. " L. K. Talasiram. |
| 11. Muhammad Meera Ravuttar Bahadur. | |

Noes.

- | | |
|---|---|
| 1. The hon. Sir Norman Macjoribanks. | 14. Mr. C. B. Cotterell. |
| 2. " Khan Bahadur Muhammad Usman Sahib Bahadur. | 15. " P. J. Gnanavaram Pillai. |
| 3. " Mr. T. E. Moir. | 16. " R. Foulkes. |
| 4. " Mr. A. Y. G. Campbell. | 17. Abbas Ali Khan Bahadur. |
| 5. " Dr. P. Subbarayan. | 18. Mr. A. B. Shetty. |
| 6. " Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar. | 19. " J. Bheemayya. |
| 7. " Mr. M. K. Seturatham Ayyar. | 20. " V. Ch. John. |
| 8. Rao Bahadur C. V. Ananatakrisna Ayyar. | 21. " Mahmud Schammad. |
| 9. Mr. F. B. Evans. | 22. " Muppil Nayyar. |
| 10. " H. A. Watson. | 23. Subadar-Major S. A. Nanjappa Bahadur. |
| 11. " G. T. Boag. | 24. Mr. T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai. |
| 12. " A. McG. O. Tampoe. | 25. " K. Krishnan. |
| 13. " S. H. Slater. | 26. " W. P. A. Soundarapandia Nadar. |
| | 27. " M. A. Manikkavelu Nayakar. |

Neutral.

- | | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| 1. Diwan Bahadur P. Kesava Pillai. | 14. Diwan Bahadur R. N. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar. |
| 2. Mr. H. B. Ari Gowder. | 15. The Zamindar of Seithur. |
| 3. " N. Siva Raj. | 16. The Zamindar of Gollapalli |
| 4. " M. V. Gangadara Siva. | 17. Mr. B. Ramachandra Reddi. |
| 5. Rao Sahib L. C. Guruswami. | 18. The Raja of Panagal. |
| 6. Mr. V. I. Muniswami Pillai. | 19. Diwan Bahadur M. Krishnan Nayyar. |
| 7. Syed Ibrahim Sahib Bahadur. | 20. Mr. T. K. Chidambaranatha Mudaliyar. |
| 8. Sir James Simpson. | 21. Rao Bahadur S. Ellappa Chettiyar. |
| 9. Mr. W. O. Wright. | 22. Abdul Razack Sahib Bahadur. |
| 10. " C. R. T. Congreve. | 23. Rao Bahadur K. Sitarama Reddi. |
| 11. The Zamindar of Kallikota. | 24. Kumara Raja of Venkatagiri. |
| 12. Mr. G. R. Premayya. | |
| 13. Rao Sahib R. Srinivasan. | |

Ayes 21. Noes 27. Neutral 24.

The motion was lost,

26th March 1928]

* Mr. R. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, I beg to move

' to reduce the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for grants for public health purposes by Rs. 100 '

with a view to discuss the question of the Cuddalore water-supply scheme. The question of providing a good drinking water-supply to Cuddalore is, if I remember right and if I am not very much mistaken, really 20 years old. Cuddalore, as the hon. Members of this House may be aware, has quite a good and pleasant climate ; it is situated on the sea-coast. But all these advantages seem to be completely impaired, if not altogether destroyed, by the lack of good drinking water-supply. Good water has been regarded as one of the tripod of life, and yet it is a sorry spectacle to find one of the districts on the Coromandal coast suffering from want of a good water-supply. About 20 years ago, a scheme was adumbrated for the purpose of giving us a good water-supply and it was one of the dreams of the late lamented Diwan Bahadur Subbarayalu Reddiyar to secure a good water-supply for this town. If he had been spared one or two years more, we would have got all that we wanted and were longing for. But fate was against us. Somewhere about 1912, investigations were carried on and two reservoirs on the bed of the Pennar were sunk at a cost of Rs. 14,000, the water was tested and it was found to be excellent. But before the scheme could be brought up for the ultimate sanction of the Government the Great War broke out, with what result ? Prices went up and it was found impossible to finance the scheme, and the whole scheme was held up. About 4 or 5 years later, in 1919, the scheme was sought to be revived by the late Diwan Bahadur Subbarayalu Reddiyar. That was just the time when the finances of the province were in an unsatisfactory state, and though the Government were in a mood to sanction it, unfortunately the local council took up a different attitude and insisted upon Government coming to the rescue of the municipality by contributing 75 per cent of the total cost. That was an attitude which was quite unreasonable on the part of the Council and no wonder that when the matter came up ultimately before Government, the Government turned it down. Some years later, a modified and less ambitious scheme was embarked upon and the matter was taken up and investigations went on, with absolutely little or no result. The Surgeon-General visited the place and between the Ministers on the one side and the department on the other, as regards the source from which water is to be tapped or taken, there has been some difference of opinion. I am told, eventually, some understanding or agreement has been arrived at. And, about this time last year, Diwan Bahadur Arogyaswami Mudaliyar visited the place and I requested him to give this matter his serious consideration. He promised to look into the matter sympathetically, and beyond giving us pious hopes he has not done anything in that direction.

" The Cuddalore Municipality has an area of about 20 square miles, and two of the main divisions of the municipality suffer largely from epidemics, such as cholera and smallpox and elephantiasis. The two divisions are Pudupalayam where my hon. Friend Mr. Sitarama Reddiyar also resides, and Cuddalore Old Town, and these are the most insanitary places in Cuddalore, and the Government have not done anything to improve them. Time and again schemes are sent up. But what is the use unless Government are prepared to suggest to the municipality a scheme of a moderate character and ask them to pay prompt attention to it? I read in the papers, after I left

[Mr. R. Srinivasa Ayyangar]

[26th March 1928]

Cuddalore, that the Cuddalore Municipal Council did meet and pass some resolution to give a protected water-supply to the two parts of the Municipality, namely, Pudupalayam and Cuddalore Old Town. They also, I understand, have resolved to levy a water-tax with retrospective effect from 1st April 1927. I am not quite sure how far it is true; that is what I gather from the papers. I doubt very much the legality of a municipality holding a meeting at the fag end of the year and levying a water-tax with retrospective effect. So there is not the ghost of a chance for good water-supply for some years to come. That is the real position of affairs. May I appeal to the hon. the Minister, who is fully conversant with the place because in other walks of life he has visited my place many a time, and I daresay I am not appealing in vain if I ask him to give it the consideration it really demands. I understand, Sir, that the scheme is not likely to cost more than Rs. 12 lakhs with a recurring expenditure of 25 or 30 thousands every year. I think instead of putting forth one excuse or another, and instead of referring it back to the municipal council, it is much better that some modest beginning is made and water is given at least to some portion of the municipal area. Notwithstanding the fact that we have been crying hoarse these 20 years, we have not had one drop of water. It is true, in the Civil Budget Estimate, I find some allotments made to some municipalities but Cuddalore is left out. It is up to the Minister to inaugurate his regime by giving us a good water-supply at the earliest possible opportunity."

* Rao Bahadur K. SITARAMA REDDIYAR :—" Sir, while sympathizing with the sentiments contained in the speech of the previous speaker, I do not know where exactly we have to throw the blame. The Government for a long time past have been laying down the policy of half-grant and I cannot take objection to this policy of theirs.

4-15
p.m.

"The whole blame rests with us. (Mr. S. Satyamurti: 'Then you don't want it?') It is not a question of my not wanting the water-supply, but this is a question of the rate-payers taking the responsibility. I am told that the rate-payers did not want to take the responsibility of levying a certain amount of tax. It is not a question of the citizens not wanting water-supply, but it is a question of the citizens being willing to pay a small amount of taxation. The matter was threshed out on many occasions. I think the Director of Public Health visited the place on one occasion and my hon. Friend Diwan Bahadur Arogyaswami Mudaliyar was also there in connexion with this scheme, which, as my hon. Friend Mr. Srinivasa Ayyangar said, has been pending for a long time. I am not prepared to throw the whole blame on the Government. They have got two schemes one for the supply of water to the whole town by means of the Pennar water which is considered to be the best water and the other for supplying water to portions of the town which suffer very badly on account of the poor supply or bad supply of water. It is mainly, I beg to submit, the look-out of the rate-payers who must be made responsible and if they are not prepared to tax themselves, I don't see why Government should prefer that place in preference to others which are willing to tax themselves. Therefore the duty of hon. Members, including my Friend Mr. Srinivasa Ayyangar, should be to educate the rate-payers to be willing to tax themselves and not to throw the blame on Government. In fact if the rate-payers are willing to finance themselves to the extent that is generally expected of them in the adumbration

26th March 1928] [Mr. K. Sitarama Reddiyar]

of such schemes, I am sure the Government will be willing to finance that scheme. This is one of the schemes sanctioned so long ago as 1914 and approved. This approval can take effect only if the rate-payers are willing to take the responsibility."

MR. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—" Mr. President, as time advances, the Government is finding more and more advocates on its behalf. It is indeed very fortunate of the Government that its advocates are increasing and growing in numbers. I thought Mr. Sitarama Reddiyar, who is the District Board President of the South Arcot district, would not be the advocate of the devil and speak in the manner in which he has done. It has now become a common practice with the Government and those people who want to advocate its cause to say that things are very impossible and so they have been abandoned. I don't think that things are really so impossible as they are represented to be, and, from my knowledge of the scheme, it seems to be quite within practicability, but it is only a question of Government financing to a certain extent and the tax-payers financing to some other extent. True, the Government cannot bear the whole burden and the municipality has to bear a portion of it. But why is it that the Government never comes forward to meet even the reasonable demands of the municipality and the tax-payers. It is not a question of Cuddalore alone, but the whole district of Cuddalore where there are several municipalities which do not have proper water-supply, and the Government has not taken steps to ensure a good water-supply."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" Order, order, I think the hon. Member will have to confine his remarks to the water-supply of the Cuddalore Municipality."

MR. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—" May I point out, Sir, it is not the municipality, but Cuddalore water-supply that is mentioned in the amendment?"

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—" My interpretation is, it is only the municipality of Cuddalore and not at all the district. The hon. Mover has confined his remarks to the municipality. I cannot permit the hon. Member to ramble about."

MR. BASHEER AHMAD SAYEED :—" I only mentioned it by way of illustration, Sir. I don't want to speak of the other portions of Cuddalore except the municipality. I only wish to associate myself entirely with what Mr. Srinivasa Ayyangar has said. I want the Government to take some steps to give effect to the proposals that are already before them if they have not already shelved them, and if they mean business."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, as my hon. Friend Mr. Sitarama Reddiyar has said, the Government is always prepared to help the people. Whenever a water-supply scheme for a town is got ready and the municipality makes an application to the Government, the Government is ever prepared to make the half-grant. As regards the Cuddalore town itself, there are two portions of the town—the old town and the new town. The old town has a protected water-supply. It is only as regards the new town the question arises. As regards the new town, a scheme was put forward about 1913 or 1914 and worked out for the half money that the tax-payers had to bear at 12 or 15 per cent. of the income on houses, but then the people demurred and the scheme was dropped. A smaller scheme was got ready which would cost 3 lakhs of rupees and which would involve an additional taxation of 9 per cent. I am glad to learn from Mr. Srinivasa

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mudaliyar]

[26th March 1928]

Ayyangar that the Municipal Council has passed a resolution to levy the tax from July 1927. At the same time he has raised the question of the legality of the resolution of the Municipal Council. He seems to suggest that the people should not be taxed. If the people do not pay the taxes or bear a portion of the burden, I am at a loss to understand how Government could help. The Government are willing to pay half the grant if the municipality pays the other half. The whole thing rests with the hon. Members of the district and the people of the district. If the people are prepared to bear a portion of the responsibility, the Government is not unwilling to make a grant."

MR. K. V. R. SWAMI :—"I move for closure, Sir."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"Mr. Srinivasa Ayyangar, are you pressing the motion?"

MR. R. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR :—"Yes, Mr. President."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The question is to reduce the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for grants for public health purposes by Rs. 100."

The motion was put to the House and declared lost.

Mr. Basheer Ahmad Sayeed demanded a poll and the House divided as follows :—

Ayes.

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. Mr. S. Satyamurti. | 11. Mr. A. Kaleswara Rao. |
| 2. " C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar. | 12. " R. Srinivasa Ayyangar. |
| 3. " J. A. Saldanha. | 13. " K. Koti Reddi. |
| 4. " G. Harisaravottama Rao. | 14. " L. K. Tulasingam. |
| 5. Abdul Hamid Khan Sahib Bahadur. | 15. " B. Ramachandra Reddi. |
| 6. Mr. K. V. R. Swami. | 16. Rao Bahadur C. S. Ratnasabapathi Mudaliyar. |
| 7. " K. R. Karant. | 17. Rao Bahadur K. Sitarama Reddi. |
| 8. " C. Obi Reddi. | 18. Kumara Raja of Venkatagiri. |
| 9. Basheer Ahmad Sayeed Sahib Bahadur. | |
| 10. Mr. P. Baktavatsulu Nayudu. | |

Noes.

- | | |
|---|--|
| 1. The hon. Sir Norman Macjoribanks. | 23. Mr. T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai. |
| 2. " Khan Bahadur Muhammad Usman Sahib Bahadur. | 24. " K. Krishnan. |
| 3. " Mr. T. E. Moir. | 25. " N. Siva Raj. |
| 4. " A. Y. G. Campbell. | 26. " M. V. Gangadara Siya. |
| 5. " M. R. Seturathnam Ayyar. | 27. Rao Sahib L. C. Guruswami. |
| 6. " S. Muthiah Mudaliyar. | 28. Mr. V. I. Muniswami Pillai. |
| 7. " Dr. P. Subbarayan. | 29. " W. P. A. Soundarapandia Nadar. |
| 8. Diwan Bahadur P. Kesava Pillai. | 30. " S. Venkiah. |
| 9. Rao Bahadur C. V. Anantakrishna Ayyar. | 31. " M. A. Manikkavelu Nayakar. |
| 10. Mr. H. A. Watson. | 32. Syed Ibrahim Sahib Bahadur. |
| 11. " G. T. Boag. | 33. Sir James Simpson. |
| 12. " A. McG. C. Tampoe. | 34. Mr. C. K. T. Congreve. |
| 13. " S. H. Slater. | 35. The Zamindar of Kallikota. |
| 14. " C. B. Cotterell. | 36. Mr. G. R. Premayya. |
| 15. " P. J. Gnanavaram Pillai. | 37. Rao Sahib R. Srinivasan. |
| 16. " R. Foulkes. | 38. Syed Tajudin Sahib Bahadur. |
| 17. Abbas Ali Khan Bahadur. | 39. Mr. V. Ramjee Rao. |
| 18. Mr. H. B. Ari Gowder. | 40. The Raja of Panagal. |
| 19. " A. B. Shetty. | 41. Rao Bahadur Sir A. P. Patro. |
| 20. " J. Bheemayya. | 42. Diwan Bahadur M. Krishnan Nayar. |
| 21. " V. Ch. John. | 43. Mr. T. K. Chidambaranatha Mudaliyar. |
| 22. Subedar-Major S. A. Nanjappa Bahadur. | 44. Rao Bahadur S. Ellappa Chettyar. |

Ayes 18. Noes 44.

The motion was declared lost.

26th March 1928]

* Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" I move

'that the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for grants for public health purposes be reduced by Rs. 100', to ask for details of grants for water-supply to Coimbatore and other places in the district of Coimbatore.

"Although my notice includes both the town and the district of Coimbatore, I want to confine myself to the specific case of the Coimbatore town itself. I am glad that the keeper of the conscience of this House, hon. Mr. Moir, is here and I appeal to him in this matter to make a note as to how the finances of this Presidency have been defrauded and how the people of Coimbatore are being in a way defrauded so that the hon. Member may look into the whole question once again and see why such things have been permitted to go on. I am going to show how Government and some of its chief officers have really defrauded Government money as well as citizens' money of Coimbatore. Luckily for us, the hon. Minister and the Government cannot say in this case that the people of the Coimbatore town have hesitated to pay their quota. For the last 25 years we have been ready to pay our quota whatever it might be. Various schemes were investigated and finally a very costly scheme was propounded and they said this scheme cost 40 lakhs and naturally the people were told that they should be prepared to pay a contribution of about 20 lakhs. We smelt that there would be something fraudulent in this matter and still we were prepared to pay the money because we have no water to drink. Whatever may be said of other places, the people of Coimbatore have got not only no good water to drink but not even any water to drink and therefore people had to agree to pay what I consider to be a very great extortion of 20 lakhs.

"Then, Sir, a scheme was adopted costing Rs. 40,00,000. We were given some hopes that this would be over in a very short time. I do say now that the whole matter began with a fraud. The Government were prepared to pay Rs. 20,00,000. I ask, Sir, how has that 20 lakhs been spent? It has been spent upon some iron pipes which are rotting both over the earth and under the earth in and near Coimbatore. I do not want to go into this miserable history of the purchase of those pipes. We were clearly made to understand on the floor of this House that the matter of purchasing of the pipes would be deeply considered, but all of a sudden we were told one day that against the rules of Government, against the order of the Government, the Chief Engineer had purchased these 20 lakhs worth of pipes. He had no authority to purchase them, we were told. We were also told that the Government were having some correspondence about this purchase. But yet we were informed that the Chief Engineer had purchased them though he had no rights. It is said that he had done so thinking he had a right to purchase them although the Government said he had no right to do so, and although Government had asked him not to purchase. Thus, Sir, the matter certainly began with a fraud by the Chief Engineer. I only say 'constructive fraud'—I do not deal with him personally but only officially. The Chief Engineer representing the Government of Madras going and purchasing Rs. 20,00,000 worth of pipes for this purpose without the authority to do so and having, as the Government said, misunderstood the orders of the Government—this is how, Sir, we were told that Rs. 20,00,000 worth of our good money was spent upon the purchase of pipes.

4-30
p.m.

[Mr. C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar] [26th March 1928]

"Then, Sir, the other question is that we were asked to pay Rs. 20,00,000 for other expenses including the making of a tunnel. Here also, Sir, I now ask the hon. the Minister to give us some information whether we are going to get water at all and if so when. We have been given so many hopes that we would be getting water one year, two years or three years hence, but I think that the Government are still in the process of creating water. Well, Sir, did we demur to pay the very high tax that was required? But the Government of that time said that we should pay $12\frac{1}{2}$ per cent water tax but upon some calculations we were able to make it $8\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. But the municipality and the Government going through the process of revision as it were enhanced our house rentals. That, I suppose, increased by 4 or 5 per cent and that made up altogether $12\frac{1}{2}$ per cent, and although we are as far from the chance of getting water we are now actually paying the water-tax. In addition to the 8 per cent of house-tax, we are paying $8\frac{1}{2}$ per cent as water-tax, these together making up $16\frac{1}{2}$ per cent. I may say in this connexion that this $8\frac{1}{2}$ per cent is only the water-tax. It does not include drainage taxes. If we want to have a drainage scheme, we will have to pay another $8\frac{1}{2}$ per cent tax.

"Whatever that may be, our concern is whether any such money is being spent usefully. I want to know whether the estimates are being kept up to their original figures. We knew the ways of the Government and their officers and we have been asking the Government, 'Do you restrict yourselves to asking only for this Rs. 20,00,000 from us?' If by the mistake of your officers or of the Government, your estimates go above Rs. 40 lakhs, we say we should not be asked to contribute more than Rs. 20,00,000, because this Rs. 20,00,000 is already too much for us to pay. But I am afraid at the rate at which the Government is going, we will soon be asked to pay more than Rs. 20,00,000. I want the hon. the Minister and the hon. the Finance Member to make a statement exactly as to whether the estimates are likely to be kept up at the original figures or are they likely to go up as in the case of the Mettur scheme. One of the works includes a tunnel across a small hillock and it seems that there has been some mistake. We are not in the confidence of the Government and I would be very glad to get at the real information from the Government. But the rumour goes that originally they estimated for a tunnel being excavated in what would be a thick rock and now it seems that the rock has disappeared and it seems to be purely a matter of soft earth or soft rock. Sir, I speak subject to correction and I am saying all this with a view to get information. Only 150 feet of this tunnel has been cut so far it seems, and even that portion is falling down, out of about 1,000 feet of the tunnel. I would be glad to know what the total length of the tunnel exactly is and how much has been cut up. The one great mistake that I am charging the Government with is that they are not sure of the tunnel and yet all the iron pipes are going under the ground although the greatest experts think the efficacy of iron will give it a life of not more than 20 years. We only think it can last for 10 or 12 years. But they say probably that it will last more, i.e., for about 20 years. Granting that some pipes are under the ground for the last one year, or two years—they are probably more anxious to put the pipes under the ground than completing the tunnel—we have to reckon that one year underground life for the pipes means washing a lakh of rupees and the loss will become greater if the tunnel is not to be available for three or four years. The pipes will be under the ground all the time and the earth will be eating them up.

26th March 1928] [Mr. C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar]

"I am, therefore, asking the Minister and the hon. the Finance Member to look into this matter and see as to why after the tunnel is almost, say 75 per cent, ready, they should not put these pipes inside the ground. This is a matter which should be taken into consideration at once because every year the pipes are kept under the ground without water passing through them would mean a waste. Even granting that it is 20 years or Rs. 20,00,000 it is worth one lakh of rupees per year and the earth has already eaten up about two or three lakhs worth and it would be going on eating up much more. Therefore, Sir, apart from other considerations, I am asking the Government as to where the necessity is to put these pipes not only all the 20 miles distance, for the tunnel is 20 miles from the town, but even inside the town, causing great inconvenience to those using the roads. They are digging culverts across roads. They are very particular in all these things, but never particular at all about the water-supply being made available to the town.

"Therefore, Sir, this is a very serious matter which the Government should take into consideration. I want that the hon. the Minister should give us an answer as to when they promise, in all human probabilities, to give us water. How long are they going to extort the water-tax from us without giving us even a drop of water?

"One other important matter, Sir, in this connexion is that Government are defrauding the people of Coimbatore in Coimbatore itself. We have got the curious practice of the Government using some portion inside the municipal limits exempt from the municipal taxes, and by magic as it were they have exempted the Central Jail which is like an island surrounded by municipal area. The same is the case with the Police Recruit school. The Forest College and the Agricultural College are practically surrounded by the municipal area and yet they have with a wave of their magic wand have declared these shall not be included in the Municipality. Why? Because they would otherwise have to pay water-tax, etc. Simply to avoid the necessity of paying water-tax they have exempted themselves. The Municipal Chairman and the Councillors passed a number of resolutions asking the Government to include these Government sites inside the municipal area so that a portion of this water-tax might be reduced. But that has not yet been done.

"The other thing we have been asking the Government is this: There is a large quantity of water available in addition to the necessities of water-supply to the town which would be useful for some cultivation purposes. The people of Coimbatore are suffering for want of water for agricultural purposes. We say, 'Let us have a portion of this water to be utilized for agricultural purposes on payment of money and the burden on the Municipality will be lessened.' But they will not do even that. The hon. the Minister in charge of the Department came with his big paraphernalia to Coimbatore. He went through the pretence of hearing us and deputations waited on him and were given plenty of hopes—all these big people give us hopes that something will be done but, alas, when they come to the headquarters nothing comes out of all their promises. This Minister also came to the headquarters and had a talk with the Secretaries and the result was that nothing was done. Sir, I have not very much hope to say now as to whether the new Minister will be allowed or will be able to do anything definite. I ask the Government to say in their conscience and I ask of the gentleman who keeps the conscience of the Government and of this House especially, to say whether this is fair,—asking us to pay Rs. 20,00,000 and then wasting the money upon pipes and burying them and not giving us any hopes as

[Mr. C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar] [26th March 1923]

to when water will be available to us, and further more, not paying us one pie for all the various big Government blocks which they possess there simply because they have the power to exempt portions from the municipal area. Supposing I get an oil engine and I am able to get water for my bungalow, shall I be exempted from the payment of the tax? Not at all. Why should these people then come and ask me to pay a tax but want to get separate consideration for themselves. While they extort money from the people by various ways, they want to deprive the Municipality of the right of getting money by taxes such as house-tax and water-tax from the various places which legitimately come under the municipal limits but which are kept back by the Government from a selfish point of view.

"I think, Sir, I have got a very good case to show that the Government are not fair in their dealings as far as this water-supply to Coimbatore is concerned."

* Rao Bahadur C. S. RATNASABAPATHI MUDALIYAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, I entirely agree with Mr. Venkataramana Ayyangar in what all he has said but I would also desire to bring to the notice of Government a few other aspects of this question. My hon. Friend, Mr. Venkataramana Ayyangar, said there has been much delay in the carrying out of the scheme. That cannot be denied even by the Government. I have frequently brought to the notice of the Government that in the matter of the tunnel work which is the most important item of the whole scheme and on the success of which depends also the success of the whole scheme, there has been very much delay. Three favourable seasons have been lost since the launching of the scheme. It is only between December and May every year that people can work at the tunnel. But, the Public Works Department have neglected this part of the work and are carrying on only the work of the pipe-laying. I cannot agree with my hon. Friend, Mr. Venkataramana Ayyangar in saying that the pipes have been ordered rather prematurely early. With regard to the pipe-laying they have kept up to the programme of their work. According to the programme settled by the Government the scheme should be completed by 1928-29. By 1928-29 the pipe-laying, the gravitation main as also the distribution main will be completed. But the most important work, i.e., the tunnelling work has been very much delayed and will not be completed by 1928-29. Even when the municipality calls for a fortnightly report of the progress of work, the Executive Engineer is very obstinate and refuses to give the report. All these, Sir, show that with regard to the tunnelling work there has been much delay and neglect on the part of the Executive Engineer.

"Now, Sir, there is also another question, and that is the levy of centage charges at 15½ per cent. The Council has been claiming that this 15½ per cent should not be levied on this scheme and their reasons are these: Even though the 15½ per cent may be generally charged for all water-supply schemes, the case of Coimbatore must be treated differently, that is because, out of the total cost of the scheme, viz., Rs. 38·38 lakhs nearly three-fourths of the cost goes towards the purchase of the pipes, i.e., Rs. 25 lakhs. Even on the value of the pipes the Government charge 15½ per cent centage charges.

"Coming to the pipes purchased for Rs. 25,00,000. Here also the Council has been badly treated. If only the Government had waited for at least six months, the cost of these pipes would have been considerably reduced. But for some reason or other, the Chief Engineer has given orders for the purchase of these pipes all on a sudden."

26th March 1928]

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—" You say you do not agree with me there."

* Rao Bahadur C. S. RATNASABAPATHI MUDALIYAR :—" I agree, but the mistake of the Chief Engineer comes in here. The order for pipes should have been placed after calling for tenders in the open market. But this has not been done by the Chief Engineer. He has simply called for quotations and without giving an opportunity for all the business concerns who trade in pipes, he has placed an order for their supply. If he had only called for tenders in the open market, I am sure that the cost of the pipes would have been reduced by at least 30 per cent. And even here, Sir, the interest of the Council is adversely affected. It is not fair for the Government to charge $15\frac{1}{2}$ per cent on the cost of pipes, especially when the purchase had been made against the interest of the Council.

" When the municipality addressed the Government on this question, they say that a general reduction of the centage charges from $15\frac{1}{2}$ per cent to something less is under the consideration of the Government. It has been under consideration now for more than two years; and the contention of the municipality throughout has been that this question should be taken up separately and dealt with on its own merits. Out of this $15\frac{1}{2}$ per cent centage charges, $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent goes towards the pay of the staff employed on this work. The Government have themselves calculated the cost of the staff that will be employed on this scheme until it is completed, and according to their own calculation, it comes up to Rs. 1,40,000. The general centage charge under this head at $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent works out to Rs. 2,50 lakhs. When Government have actually calculated that the cost of the staff will come to Rs. 1,40,000, I again ask whether they are justified in charging $7\frac{1}{2}$ per cent or Rs. 2,50 lakhs.

4-45
P.M.

" Now, Sir, coming to the question of the inclusion of the Central Jail and the Police Recruit school buildings at Coimbatore within the municipal limits, my hon. Friend has already referred to them. He said that the Council has applied for the inclusion of these buildings within the municipal limits. My point is that they are already situated within the municipal limits of Coimbatore, but they are excluded for purposes of taxation. These two institutions, the jail and the recruit school, are situated at the highest level possible in the whole of the town, and they suffer most for want of water. In the reports of the Central Jail, it has been repeatedly stated that the jail has not got an adequate or a good supply of water. In spite of it, Sir, the Government in order to avoid taxing these institutions, do not want to give them the benefit of the water-supply. I do not know whether it is the intention of the Government to include these two institutions within the municipal limits just after the scheme is completed. The municipal town is paying now a tax of 8 per cent and not $8\frac{1}{2}$ per cent as my friend said. The Government may very well say that after the scheme is completed they will be prepared to include these two institutions. Sir, when the whole town is now paying tax at the rate of $15\frac{1}{2}$ per cent I do not know why the jail and the police school alone should be exempted from payment of this tax especially when they enjoy all the amenities of municipal administration.

ai.

" Coming now to the agricultural aspect of this scheme, the Council has been repeatedly asking that the scheme which is being worked at a heavy cost should also benefit irrigation, and Government have been stubbornly refusing to investigate this question. I may say for the information of the House and

[Mr. C. S. Ratnasabapathi Mudaliyar] [26th March 1928]

of Mr. C. V. Venkataramana Ayyangar that the Government have now agreed to ask the Chief Engineer to arrange for the actual gauging of the rainfall on the hills, and when that is done, I hope the Government will make the scheme benefit the agricultural lands in the taluk and thereby waive the costs of the headworks to the extent to which the agricultural lands will be benefited."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—" Mr. President, Sir, the hon. Member for Coimbatore has been telling us that the people of Coimbatore have been saying that these pipes were purchased at a time when they need not have been purchased and that they have been buried in the ground before the tunnel has been completed. In sanctioning these estimates, the Government have fixed a certain period within which they said the works should be completed and it ought to be the endeavour of the Government to see to that. But in certain instances, unforeseen circumstances do happen, and in this case, as my hon. Friend told me some time back, the place where it was first proposed to place the tunnel has been found to be a sandy place and therefore it is a bit more difficult to put it there than was originally expected. I may tell you, however, Sir, that the work was expected to be completed in 1928-29, i.e., in the course of another year or so, but Government think that it may take another year more and very much regret that there has been a delay of about a year in the completion of the work. All that I can say is that the people of Coimbatore should patiently put up with this small delay, because it is certainly the intention of the Government to do as much as is possible for them to do in this matter.

"Then, Sir, both the hon. Members from Coimbatore told us that the Engineering department is not going on with the tunnelling portion of the work as briskly as they go on with the laying of pipes. There are two different parts of the work to be done, and one has to get on as well as the other; and as my hon. Friend himself said, the tunnelling work can be done only during three or four months in a year. And if in those three or four months there is any slackening in the matter, that will be gone into and necessary instructions to the officer carrying on the work there will be issued, to expedite the work as much as possible."

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"What about the whole work?"

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"As I have already stated, the work is expected to be completed in two years that is to say by the year 1930. The question of the pipes having been ordered without advertisement and without Government Orders was the subject of a discussion and of questions also in this House on more than one occasion previously. I think in the year 1926 at the instance of my hon. Friend the matter was fully dealt with, and nothing has happened subsequent to that to revive a discussion on this subject. With these few words, Mr. President, I may assure the representatives of the Coimbatore district that the Government are anxious to push through the work as quickly as possible.

"As regards the centage charges which the hon. Member for Coimbatore referred to, it is being levied uniformly for all the works in the province. If the hon. Member for Coimbatore thinks that an exemption ought to be made

26th March 1928]

[Mr. S. Muthiah Mualiyar]

in the case of the Coimbatore district, it is for him to make out a case for its exemption. And though the Government will be sympathetically disposed towards any such application, they may probably be unable to treat Coimbatore as an exception. The matter is however under consideration and if legally it is possible to show any concession to Coimbatore, I may assure him that it will be done."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"Does the hon. Member propose to press the motion?"

Mr. C. V. VENKATARAMANA AYYANGAR :—"Yes, Sir."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"The question is to reduce the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for grants for public health purposes by Rs. 100."

The motion was put to the House and lost.

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"I think I may now put the demand to the vote of the House."

* Mr. J. A. SALDANHA :—"As regards my Motion No. 847 'to reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,75,500 for expenditure in connexion with epidemic diseases by Rs. 100', I want to put only one question, Sir."

* The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"I have no objection to call the names of hon. Members who have given notice of the other motions. In that case, I am afraid the hon. Member will have to wait."

* Mr. T. M. NARAYANASWAMI PILLAI :—"Mr. President, Sir, I beg to move

'that the allotment of Rs. 29,26,000 for grants for public health purposes be reduced by Rs. 100.'

"Sir, my object is to urge upon the Government the necessity for immediately sanctioning the Srirangam drainage scheme.

"Sir, very few minutes are at my disposal and I shall not waste the time of the Council. That the Srirangam municipality requires a drainage scheme urgently cannot be denied. The necessity for this scheme has been recognized more than fifteen years ago; but the pity is that the scheme, the necessity for which has all along been recognized, has been delayed for such a long time. Sir, it was started in the year 1911-12 and it has been hanging fire all these years. Srirangam, as you know, Sir, is a great sacred town so far as we Hindus are concerned. It has got a provincial importance if not an all-India importance. Almost every day we see hundreds of pilgrims gathering in the city and on festival occasions, thousands of people go to the place. It is therefore of the utmost importance to the whole province and even to the whole of India to keep the health of this city in a good condition. If the health of Srirangam is bad, it is not Srirangam alone that will be affected, but the rest of the presidency and the rest of India will also be affected. Therefore, Sir, we have been all along agitating for this scheme. Of late, the health of the city has been going down and it has become a breeding place for mosquitoes. That is why we have been strongly urging on the Government the necessity for the drainage scheme. We wanted also a preferential treatment for Srirangam. It is not enough that the Government sanction a half-grant. On account of the peculiar position and importance of Srirangam, we

[Mr. T. M. Narayanaswami Pillai] [26th March 1928]

wanted that the Government should come forward with a full grant. The Government were in favour of that and the hon. the Minister for Public Health, Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar, when he visited the place last year promised to go into the question; and relying on the promises of the Government, several walls have been dismantled and the city is now in a worse condition than when the scheme was first inaugurated. With these few words, Sir, I would like to urge upon the Government the immediate necessity for sanctioning the scheme."

* The hon. Mr. S. MUTHIAH MUDALIYAR :—"Mr. President, Sir, the scheme for the drainage of the Srirangam municipality is almost ready and I think it will be sanctioned in the course of the year; and if the municipality will undertake to carry the work through and pay the contribution that they will have to pay, the Government are not anxious to place any impediment in their way; on the other hand, they are quite willing to help the municipality in carrying this scheme to completion."

* Mr. T. M. NARAYANASWAMI PILLAI :—"Sir, I withdraw the motion in view of the remarks made by the hon. the Minister."

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

The hon. the PRESIDENT :—"I am afraid there is no possibility of Mr. Saldanha's motion being reached, and so I will now put the Demand to the House.

"The question is that Government be granted a sum not exceeding 45'67 lakhs under Demand XXI—Public Health and Vital Statistics."

The motion was put to the House and carried and the grant was made.

The House then adjourned to meet again at 11 o'clock the next day.

R. V. KRISHNA AYYAR,
Secretary to the Legislative Council.

வாய்மையே வெல்லும்
TRUTH ALONE TRIUMPHS